



Minutes Tempe Aviation Commission January 13, 2015

Minutes of the Tempe Aviation Commission meeting held on January 13, 2015, 6:30 p.m., at the Public Works Conference Room, Garden Level, City Hall Complex, 31 E. Fifth Street, Tempe, Arizona.

(MEMBERS) Present:

Lane Carraway
Shannon Dutton
Mark Garrigan
Gordon Gauss
Lance McIntosh*
David Naugle

(MEMBERS) Absent:

James Wennlund

Citizens Present:

Barbara Sherman
Ledell Roesner

City Staff Present:

David McNeil, Environmental Services
Manager
Oddvar Tveit, Environmental Quality
Specialist

Meeting convened at 6:37 p.m.

With consent from attending members the previous chair Barbara Sherman suggested she lead the meeting until a new chair was elected for 2015.

Agenda Item 1 – Public Appearances

Barbara Sherman

As an outgoing commissioner and a member of the public, Barbara Sherman distributed two letters, one from her thanking the city, the commission's staff and the members of the commission, and another from the North Tempe Neighborhood Association thanking the Council and outgoing Councilmembers Shana Ellis and Onnie Shekerjian for supporting the effort to establish communication about airport environmental impacts with Phoenix elected officials. In addition, commissioners discussed the statement from the commission that was provided to the Council several weeks earlier regarding a meeting between Tempe and Phoenix. Members were uncertain regarding whether or not there will be a meeting between elected officials from the two cities.

Resident Ledell Roesner

South Tempe resident Ledell Roesner asked the commission to address whether anything has been done by the commission in response to the new flight procedures that have concentrated flights over her home in South Tempe. She inquired regarding the FAA law suit and settlement years ago, and how that law suit has impacted the new flight procedures. Additionally, Ms.

*Attending by telephone conference call.

Roesner asked how the FAA can change where planes are flying over residential areas without providing compensation to those residents who have bought and invested in their homes believing they were not located under a flight path for a major airport? Commissioners expressed sympathy, and discussed limitations in the commission's and the settlement's ability to prompt FAA mitigation or compensation for noise impacts. In the settlement, the FAA committed to disclosing airport instrument flight procedure proposals before they are finalized to an aviation industry working group called the Phoenix Airspace Users Working Group (PAUWG), of which Tempe is a member. In a written statement that TAVCO provided to the Tempe Council several weeks ago, the commission also addressed how the area navigation (RNAV) flight procedures have concentrated flight paths over residential areas in South Tempe.

Agenda Item 2 – Consideration of Meeting Minutes (December 9, 2014)

Barbara Sherman asked for comments on the minutes and for a motion to approve.

Motion: Shannon Dutton moved to approve the minutes. Lane Carraway seconded the motion.

Action: The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

Agenda Item 3 – Election of Officers

Ms. Sherman explained that Shannon Dutton was nominated to serve as commission chair for 2015, and requested a motion to elect a new chair for the commission.

Motion: Lane Carraway moved to elect Shannon Dutton as the new chair. Mark Garrigan seconded the motion.

Action: Ms. Dutton was elected TAVCO Chair by unanimous vote.

Ms. Dutton assumed the role of commission Chair for the remainder of the meeting.

Shannon Dutton explained that two candidates, Gordon Gauss and Lance McIntosh, were nominated for the position of vice chair at the December meeting but that neither nominee was present to accept their nominations.. Mr. Gauss accepted the nomination for Vice Chair for 2015, and Mr. McIntosh declined the nomination to support Gordon Gauss as the sole candidate.

Motion: Lane Carraway made a motion to elect Gordon Gauss as the new vice chair for the commission. Mark Garrigan seconded the motion.

Action: The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

Agenda Item 4 – Update from Staff

1) Meeting Minutes

Staff is considering alternative meeting minute formats to better align meeting minutes with guidance provided by the City Clerk's Office. Alternatives being considered are the current format, which is closer to a meeting transcript with often direct recitation of technical and non-technical statements made, and a format that reflects the Tempe City Clerk's Legal Requirements, Key Principles, and Drafting Rules for Council Commission minutes (included in handouts). The latter format is characterized by accuracy and completeness; a focus on key points made; logical and issue-based organization rather than chronological transcript; and concise, point-form summaries. The goal of a new format would be to make the content of minutes more accessible to non-attending residents, city management, and decision-makers on City Council.

Several commissioners expressed a desire to retain the current level of detail for meeting minutes, favoring a format that provided an effective working document for commission members with a technical understanding of the issues being considered, and a level of detail that might be necessary for the purpose of legal disclosure or support. Staff explained, and some members recognized, that a greater level of technical detail can also be more difficult to understand, and make the issues less accessible for members of Council to which the commission is advisory.

Commissioners concluded that ideally, minutes would incorporate the principles in the City Clerk's guidance to provide clear accounts of the issues discussed, decisions made, and rationale considered that are accessible to users with a less technical understanding than commissioners, but commission members would continue to receive working meeting notes that maintain the level of detail currently being provided.

Action: 1) Staff will develop two alternative meeting records at the next meeting, a traditional detailed account of the deliberations and minutes which reflect the City Clerk's guidance.
2) Staff will consult with the City Attorney's Office regarding public records law and any limitations to producing both minutes and working notes, and requirements for filing all documents with the City Clerk's Office.

2) Annual Compliance Report

The annual compliance report provides information on: a) Departure compliance with the Tempe/Phoenix agreement to route eastward departures within the Salt River corridor without veering out of the river channel until they reach the eastern Tempe border; b) compliance with the agreement to distribute departures evenly to the east and west, during daytime hours, nighttime hours, and collectively; c) annual cumulative noise exposure levels, and how levels compared to the 65 Day-Night Level (65 DNL), the FAA's threshold for "significant noise exposure", and d) the number of noise complaints reported in Tempe for the calendar year.

- a) Data indicates that there has been an improvement in compliance with noise mitigation departure procedure over Tempe in 2014 with the implementation of new area navigation (RNAV) Standard Instrument Departure (SID) procedures, and that American Airlines/US Airways flying under the "cactus" call sign stands out as the most compliant airline.
- b) The airport has achieved a 50/50 east/west departure split over 24 hours, but nighttime departures are weighted more heavily toward the east, with 60% of departures between 10:00 p.m. and 07:00 a.m. going east.
- c) The 2014 data shows 24 hour average noise levels for the year below 65 DNL.
- d) Forty-six aircraft noise complaints were received during 2014, the lowest since registration started in 2001. The majority of the complaints addressed arrivals on both sides of the riverbed. Complaints were also received from residents located in areas close to more confined flight paths in South Tempe.

Agenda Item 5 – Drones

This discussion was carried over from the December commission meeting, and focused on the use of drones in Tempe City parks. Tempe City Code Chapter 23, Article III Section 23-40 (a) (9) prohibits model aircraft use in Tempe Beach Park and Rio Salado Park. Members discussed how these restrictions might be implemented in other City parks within proximity of

the airport and flight paths by informing the public using the parks about the FAA's guidance and requirement for the use Unmanned Aerial Vehicles (UAVs).

Members recognized that the commission was limited to considering how private drone use impacts noise exposure and flight safety

Action: Staff will get back to the members with more information about the section in the City Code and will evaluate the possibility of posting informative signs at city parks.

Agenda Item 6 – Arrival Paths

Aircraft are sequenced to merge on to a final parallel approach path to PHX outboard runways. When traffic allows, some planes follow a different approach to be able to land on the center runway. A few times every month some planes merge late on a final approach path or divert from a normal straight in approach by executing unusual maneuvers just before landing. Staff has conducted studies in November of 2004, 2006, 2011 and 2014 to evaluate the extent of late merge and other unusual maneuvers that result in arrivals being diverted over North Tempe's residential neighborhoods.

Data collected during these studies shows that the numbers of late merge and noise-producing maneuvers during afternoon and evening hours decreased in 2011 and 2014 from earlier years, but so did the total number of westward arrivals. Accordingly, reductions over time could be attributable to better adherence to arrival procedures, fewer arrivals, or a combination of the two. Additionally, data showed slightly more late merges and late maneuvers on the north side in 2011 and 2014, a shift from 2004 and 2006, when most of them were on the south side of the river bed.

Agenda Item 6 – Commissioners' Business (topics for future discussion)

Continued discussion of drones

Agenda Item 7 – Schedule next TAVCO meeting

The next meeting was scheduled for February 10, 2015.

Agenda Item 8 – Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 8:37 p.m.

Prepared by: Oddvar Tveit

Reviewed by: Marilyn DeRosa

Authorized Signature
Deputy Public Works Director- Water Utilities