

Minutes of the Development Review Commission March 14, 2017

Minutes of the regular hearing of the Development Review Commission, of the City of Tempe, was held in Council Chambers,
31 East Fifth Street, Tempe, Arizona

Present:

Chair Linda Spears
Vice Chair David Lyon
Commissioner Thomas Brown
Commissioner Angela Thornton
Commissioner Andrew Johnson
Commissioner Philip Amorosi
Commissioner Scott Summers

Absent:

Alternate Commissioner Gerald Langston
Alternate Commissioner Barbara Lloyd
Alternate Commissioner Nicholas Labadie

City Staff Present:

Suparna Dasgupta, Principal Planner
Diana Kaminski, Senior Planner
Sarah Adame, Administrative Assistant

Hearing convened at 6:02 p.m. and was called to order by Chair Linda Spears.

Consideration of Meeting Minutes:

- 1) Study Session Minutes, February 15, 2017
MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Thornton to approve Study Session minutes for February 15, 2017. Motion seconded by Vice-Chair Lyon.
VOTE: Motion passes 6-0
- 2) Regular Meeting Minutes, February 15, 2017
MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Thornton to approve Regular Meeting minutes for February 15, 2017. Motion seconded by Vice-Chair Lyon.
VOTE: Motion passes 6-0
- 3) Request for a Planned Area Development Overlay, Development Plan Review for an on-line pre-owned vehicle retail store, a use permit to allow vehicle sales in the GID district, and a use permit to exceed the maximum allowed surface parking for **CARVANA (PL160462)**, located at 706 North Scottsdale Road. The applicant is Gammage and Burnham, PLC.
MOTION: Motion made by Vice-Chair Lyon to continue to the March 28, 2017 the request for a Planned Area Development Overlay, Development Plan Review for an on-line pre-owned vehicle retail store, a use permit to allow vehicle sales in the GID district, and a use permit to exceed the maximum allowed surface parking for **CARVANA (PL160462)**, located at 706 North Scottsdale Road. Motion seconded by Commissioner Johnson.
VOTE: Motion passes 7-0

The following items were considered for **Public Hearing**:

- 4) Request for a Zoning Map amendment, Planned Area Development Overlay and Development Plan Review for 18 single-family detached homes for **SHADOW ROCK (PL160460)**, located at 2722 North College Avenue. The applicant is Gammage and Burnham PLC.

PRESENTATION BY STAFF:

Ms. Diana Kaminski, Senior Planner, gave a brief presentation, explaining the request, the site is at the southwest corner of College Ave and Continental Drive. There is a school (in Scottsdale) to the north, the Pera Club is to the west, and the property is surrounded by single family homes to the south and the east. The zoning change request from R1-6 to R1-4 would allow for greater density. The 18 single family detached homes will have a north-south orientation. She shared landscaping plans, building elevations, roof and floor plans. There are three styles of homes: French, Spanish, and Tuscan. With five different elevations, there are 15 possible color palettes for the homes. There are also different landscape packages from which to choose. With all of the options available, this small development of homes will give the feel of a custom neighborhood due to the variations in product and style. There is a stipulation that a home with the same color palette and same elevation cannot be adjacent to another on the same street. The applicant hosted several neighborhood meetings focusing on the immediate neighbors surrounding the property. There was also a larger neighborhood meeting, which about 50 people attended. Comment cards are included with the report. Staff received two letters of support and one in opposition, which she shared with the Commission this evening at Study Session. A voice mail of support was left for Ms. Kaminski late this afternoon. Staff is recommending approval with stipulations.

PRESENTATION BY APPLICANT:

Ms. Susan Demmitt of Gammage and Burnham, PLC gave a presentation on behalf of homebuilder Taylor Morrison. She stated that Taylor Morrison is recognized as one of the top home builders in the Phoenix metropolitan area. They are one of the very few large homebuilders that regularly take on small infill sites such as this one. This is a two and a quarter acre site, and the builder was glad to bring a residential subdivision to an existing residential area. The applicant's request tonight was outlined by Ms. Kaminski, asking for a step-up in density, a Planned Area Development Overlay for specific design standards, and a Development Plan Review, so the Commission sees the exact product. Neighborhood meetings and stakeholder meetings have been ongoing since September 2016, before an application was submitted to the City. She described the layouts of the homes including square footage, bedroom count, garages, etc, and stated there will be a Homeowner's Association. Over the six months of working with neighbors, there were strategic changes made to the site plan. Neighbors were concerned about privacy, with two-story homes being built among the existing single-story homes. There are deeper back yards for the five properties on the south side to create more of a buffer there, there will be two fast-growing trees planted in each back yard that are in the closest proximity to the neighbors. There will be an 8 foot wall on the south and west perimeters of the project, with a 6 foot wall on the north and the east perimeter. There will be a monument sign for the development using colors complementing the Papago Park area. There will be a new 6 foot wide sidewalk on both College and Continental. In listening to the neighbors and to staff, they have modified the Ranch style elevation, adding a brick veneer finish. They did not satisfy everyone, but feel that they worked hard to address all concerns that were feasible. They have had a warm response from the surrounding community. If all approvals take place, they expect to begin construction in September.

Commissioner Brown stated that he likes the colors, but he would like to see them a bit richer, as colors do fade over time. He believes the landscaping looks fantastic, in looking at the details on light fixtures and exterior elements, he wondered if the front doors are real wood. Ms. Demmitt stated they are not; they are fiberglass and wood, as per the typical market demand, which is for low maintenance. In response to Commissioner Brown's further questioning as to whether the individual project managers can allow greater flexibility, Ms. Demmitt stated that the upgrade packages for these homes have not yet been determined, but the builder does rely on the "tried and true" options that consumers consistently want, one of which is low maintenance features. Therefore she cannot guarantee that there will be an option of a wood door. Commissioner Brown then asked if she could explain further the quality of the project. Ms. Demmitt deferred to Mr. Colin Phipps of Taylor Morrison at 9000 East Pima Center Parkway, Scottsdale. He stated that there is an option for an upgrade to a steel-clad door. To answer the "quality" question, they have been named America's Most Trusted Builder by a national survey; they are also Arizona's Top Production Builder for the last three years. Their homes rank very highly on the energy efficiency rating scales. Commissioner Brown asked about the insulation ratings in the exterior walls, Mr. Phipps responded that the Home Energy Rating System (HERS) rating is above the national standard.

Vice-Chair Lyon inquired as to why this site wants more than 9 homes, which would match the existing zoning and what is currently there. Ms. Demmitt stated that is basically pragmatics – the cost of land, the cost of building, and what consumers are willing to pay for homes. If it were only 9 homes, the cost of each home would be too high, and would not match the community. It is a question of economics and trying to come up with a happy medium. It does provide diversity and options for this neighborhood. Vice-Chair Lyon stated that he understands that answer on the developer side, but what about the community side, as the Commission needs to consider that as well. Ms. Demmitt reiterated that they worked with the community for months before they submitted for this project, and they have been very transparent with the neighbors all along. The neighbors overall recognized the challenges of a builder in this small infill site, and worked with Taylor Morrison, in the end preferring them and wanting this development in their neighborhood.

Commissioner Johnson inquired about the colors of the driveways in the renderings. Ms. Demmitt explained that the driveways will be pavers, available in different colors to complement the landscape package. He then asked about the sidewalk to the north, and how wide it will be. Ms. Demmitt explained that it would be a new 6 foot wide sidewalk on College Ave and Continental. The bus stop that currently exists at that location will be re-landscaped and shade added, it will also be ADA compliant.

Commissioner Amorosi asked about the "Tuscan" elevation, stating it doesn't really fit, as there are no other Tuscan type styles in the surrounding area, as there are Ranch and Spanish. Ms. Demmitt responded that this was driven by consumer preferences, and beyond that, the Ranch and Spanish will not "match" what is in the surrounding area either, they are very different, but it is current with today's market trends.

Chair Spears stated that she had previously discussed with the applicant that there are effectively four parking spaces at each home, perhaps with four bedroom houses, students might be living there, creating round-the-clock parking in the driveways. The applicant has agreed to address this issue within the CC&R's.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Ms. Kim Loza of 206 E. Papago Circle South stated that she is a rural carrier, and one of Taylor Morrison's developments is on her route. She stated that in her experience they were a great homebuilder, kept to their schedules and produced quality homes. The neighbors would love to see 9 homes like the ones in which they live, but they recognize that in the General Plan, more density is allowed here, and they would rather have single family homes there than something like apartments. She was impressed that the applicant had many more neighborhood meetings than required, and responded to the concerns of the residents. Not everyone is on board, as some neighbors will lose their views, but the majority are on board.

Chair Spears stated that there were three emails received by staff today, two in opposition and one in support. They will be included in the official record of this meeting.

APPLICANT RESPONSE:

Ms. Demmitt pointed out that she realized the opposition emails had been received today, but there are also comment cards in support that were received at the neighborhood meetings included in the packet this evening as well. Commissioner Brown asked about pricing on the homes. Ms. Demmitt responded that the projections are \$350,000 to \$450,000.

COMMENTS BY THE COMMISSION:

Commissioner Amorosi stated that he is very pleased to see an infill project that will be detached single family homes, when we typically see apartments. He will support.

Commissioner Sumners thanked the applicant for the outreach to the surrounding community, and thanked Ms. Loza for attending tonight to show her support. He believes this is about finding the right balance for this site, and he appreciates that this infill site is not a gated community with high walls surrounding it, which has happened many times in Tempe. He is happy to see that is not gated, is open, has wider sidewalks and underground power lines, etc. He is happy to support the project.

Commissioner Brown appreciated the cross-section views, they were to scale and believable. He would like to see these with all developments near single family residences.

Commissioner Thornton thanked the applicant for their outreach to the neighborhood and Ms. Loza for attending tonight to voice her support. She believes it is a beautiful project, and is glad to see single-family for sale product at this site. She will support.

MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Thornton to approve a Zoning Map amendment, Planned Area Development Overlay and Development Plan Review for 18 single-family detached homes for **SHADOW ROCK (PL160460)**, located at 2722 North College Avenue. Motion seconded by Commissioner Summers.
VOTE: Motion passes 7-0

STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS:

Ms. Dasgupta reviewed agenda items for the upcoming March 28, 2017 meeting. It will include: Streetlights Rio 2100, Carvana, Lemon Mixed Use Development, Miller-Curry Townhomes, and Medical Marijuana Code Text Amendment.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:57 pm.

Prepared by: Cynthia Jarrad



Reviewed by:

Suparna Dasgupta, Principal Planner, Community Development Planning