

## Minutes of the Development Review Commission April 25, 2017

Minutes of the regular hearing of the Development Review Commission, of the City of Tempe, was held in Council Chambers,  
31 East Fifth Street, Tempe, Arizona

**Present:**

Chair Linda Spears  
Vice Chair David Lyon  
Commissioner Thomas Brown  
Commissioner Angela Thornton  
Commissioner Andrew Johnson  
Commissioner Philip Amorosi  
Commissioner Scott Summers

**Absent:**

Alternate Commissioner Barbara Lloyd  
Alternate Commissioner Gerald Langston  
Alternate Commissioner Nicholas Labadie

**City Staff Present:**

Suparna Dasgupta, Principal Planner  
Karen Stovall, Senior Planner  
Cynthia Jarrad, Administrative Assistant

Hearing convened at 6:00 p.m. and was called to order by Chair Linda Spears.

### Consideration of Meeting Minutes:

The following Agenda items #1 and #2 were considered together.

- 1) Study Session Minutes, March 28, 2017
- 2) Regular Meeting Minutes, March 28, 2017

**MOTION:** Motion made by Commissioner Thornton to approve Study Session and Regular Meeting minutes for March 28, 2017. Motion seconded by Vice-Chair Lyon.

**VOTE:** Motion passes 6-0

- 5) Request for an Amended Planned Area Development Overlay and Development Plan Review for a new 26-story multi-family residential development, containing 328 dwelling units for **7<sup>TH</sup> & FOREST (PL160265)**, located at 707 South Forest Avenue. The applicant is Gammage and Burnham, PLC.

**MOTION:** Motion made by Commissioner Brown to continue this request to an unspecified date. Motion seconded by Commissioner Thornton.

**VOTE:** Motion passes 7-0.

- 4) Request for an Amended Planned Area Development for the phased demolition of 488 existing units to be replaced with 201 duplex units, 28 townhouse-style units, and 212 apartment units and a Development Plan Review for six single-story duplex units and 212 apartment units within a five-story building for **FRIENDSHIP VILLAGE (PL170037)**, located at 2645 East Southern Avenue. The applicant is Ryan Companies US, Inc.

### PRESENTATION BY STAFF:

Ms. Karen Stovall, Senior Planner, gave a presentation concerning the project. She stated the property is currently zoned R1-4 PAD and R-4 PAD. The entire PAD is 42.91 acres in size, and the amended PAD request does not impact the permitted development standards currently allowed by the PAD. The proposal would modify the existing

site plan by replacing 296 Cottage-style units with 202 units in a phased approach. The three cottage buildings in the northwest corner of the site were approved and constructed in 2016, and the applicant is seeking approval to demolish and replace the remaining cottages. In the area of 13 existing Cottage buildings located in the middle of the community, a 28 unit, two-story Townhouse-style apartment building would be added. Also, the existing 192 unit Courtyard Apartment building would be replaced with a 212 unit building. Phase 1 of this new apartment is four-stories high and will occupy an area of existing surface parking spaces, locating the building closer to Southern Avenue than the existing apartments. As a result of this proposal, the number of dwelling units would decrease by 46, from 572 to 526. To the east of the new cottages will be a new pickle ball court, pavers, a pergola, and landscaping. Ms. Stovall shared renderings and elevations, building materials, colors, design elements for the new buildings/cottages/apartments, and explained vehicle access and parking. A neighborhood meeting was held in February 2017, with 121 persons in attendance. Most of the concern in the meeting was parking, where construction crews would park, lack of sidewalks on interior private streets, and landscaping. One email and one phone call were received by staff concerning Friendship Village employees parking in the subdivision to the west. Staff recommends approval of both requests, subject to the conditions in the staff report.

**PRESENTATION BY APPLICANT:**

Mr. Sameer Kulkarni, Senior Architect at Ryan Companies US, Inc. gave a brief presentation. He reiterated that the project would be done in phases, Phase 1 will include the first building going up in the northeast corner before any demolition takes place, then they will continue to build and demolish with a domino effect. The cottages on the northwest will mimic what has already been built on the other side of the street. They have added color and window variations to add some variety at the City's request. Parking has been a topic of discussion among neighbors; he explained that most of the existing parking issues are from increased staffing. This has caused spillover into the neighboring streets west of the property. To mitigate this, during construction, staff and construction workers will be utilizing 50 spots at the Catholic Church across the street to the north and 150 spots to the east, in hospital parking. After all phases of the building construction are finished, there will be 300 new underground parking spots onsite. Parking problems will be partially mitigated as each phase is finished, for a total of more than 300 spots at project's end. Tonight the focus is on the apartments and the six cottages; they will be back before the Commission for DPR's for the future phases.

Commissioner Thornton inquired about the final number of parking spots, how many will be for employees and how many for others and/or visitors. Mr. Kulkarni responded that staff is currently 50-100, so there will be 200 parking spots for visitors in the future.

Commissioner Brown inquired if all the cottages on the site will be replaced, like these first six are. Mr. Kulkarni responded yes, over time, they all will be replaced, the first six will be a prototype. Commissioner Brown then asked about half of each two car garage being dedicated to storage or workshop space, as this had been mentioned in the presentation. Mr. Kulkarni responded that this is in accordance with Friendship Village's direction, as current residents have had to create their own storage spaces and they would like a more uniform look.

Commissioner Sumners asked for clarification on the number of residents currently, and what number of residents are expected at completion. After some discussion, Mr. Kulkarni stated that unit number will actually go down, but bedroom count and resident count should go up, the number of residents is expected to increase from 240 to 350.

Commissioner Amorosi asked if the new units will be energy efficient and/or certified as energy efficient. Mr. Kulkarni stated that existing structures and systems are 25 years old, and all electrical and mechanical will be brought up to today's standards. They have not considered specifics of energy efficient strategies yet, except for window shades.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Mr. David Richardson of 2472 E. Pebble Beach Drive spoke about parking along Evergreen. He stated that staff for the nursing care at that location is parking there, and there have been near accidents. Especially on Pebble Beach and Manhattan, vehicles are speeding and not adhering to the speed limits. He stated that from Malibu north to Southern and then from there south to Ehrhardt Park, there are 48 cars parked every day. The applicant said this would be addressed, but it has not been. He is concerned that construction traffic will add to this, as they are also parking on Malibu and Pebble Beach.

**COMMISSION COMMENTS:**

Chair Spears commented that typically, residents of Friendship Village, since it is a staged development, begin there in one unit and then downsize to something smaller, with one car and sometimes a golf cart.

She also asked if Staff could work on making sure there is enforcement of traffic/parking regulations at the site, per Mr. Richardson's previous comments.

Vice Chair Lyon stated that he doesn't have any issues with the proposal, the site is in need of updating and these changes are appropriate for the site.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Amorosi made a motion to approve an Amended Planned Area Development for the phased demolition of 488 existing units to be replaced with 201 duplex units, 28 townhouse-style units, and 212 apartment units and a Development Plan Review for six single-story duplex units and 212 apartment units within a five-story building for **FRIENDSHIP VILLAGE (PL170037)**, located at 2645 East Southern Avenue. Motion seconded by Commissioner Johnson.

**VOTE:** Motion passes 6-1, with Commissioner Brown in the opposition.

- 3) Request for a Development Plan Review consisting of a phased commercial office development with two four-story office buildings and parking structures for **FREEDOM RIO 2100 (PL170062)** located at 2108 East Rio Salado Parkway. The applicant is Butler Design Group.

Vice-Chair Lyon recused himself from this agenda item, citing conflict of interest. He stepped down from the dais.

**PRESENTATION BY STAFF:**

Ms. Diana Kaminski, Senior Planner, gave a presentation on the project. She described the site and its location. The site is oriented for maximum visibility from the Loop 202 Freeway; there are pedestrian connections within the campus and also to Streetlights residential development and Tempe Marketplace. Phase 1 will be the office building on the western side of this site, with Phase 2 being the building on the eastern side. The buildings are connected by a ground floor outdoor dining area for the employees. There is a complex landscape palette; the channel along the north side will need to be reviewed by the Maricopa County Flood Control District before construction can begin. The office building floor plans mirror each other, and are identical. She shared elevations and images of the project. Staff's concern was with the garage, as it is visible to the residents to the west, so screening and aesthetics were scrutinized. The applicant has complied with this request and added some artistic elements to the screening. Staff has not received any calls of inquiry or concern, and is recommending approval of the project.

**PRESENTATION BY APPLICANT:**

Mr. Jeff Cutberth of Butler Design Group, 5017 E. Washington, Phoenix, AZ gave a presentation. Butler Design has been involved in the development in and around this site for the past 15 years. He shared the site plan, stating they wanted to get the buildings "jutting out" toward the freeway, which is shown. Their design kept the entrances to the garage in strategic places to get the cars in and hidden as soon as possible and away from the pedestrian zones.

Since this site is a former land fill, there will be another twelve feet of fill on which these buildings will sit, so the buildings will actually sit at the same height as the freeway. There will be a terraced feel, with a retaining wall, a very nice composition along the freeway. The fire lane access will be at a lower grade, so it will not be visible from the freeway, it will look as though the buildings are on a podium. As one enters the campus, they might notice similar or the same design elements as surrounding structures. There is a maximum amount of glass on the north side, which faces the freeway, and minimal glass on the east, west and south, for best solar orientation. The reflectivity of the glass is in the 10 to 19 percent range which is low; some other problematic projects in the area have reflectivity as high as 40 percent or more. To create some connectivity with the community, the glass is not highly reflective and people can actually see inside. The multi-modal path that runs along the west will include artistic elements and building materials, which will benefit pedestrians and the residential development to the west.

Commissioner Johnson inquired about the fire lane and whether it will be incorporated into the landscape and open to the public, given its proximity to the multi-modal path. Mr. Cutberth stated that the fire land is not accessible to the public and will be gated for emergency use only; it does not restrict pedestrians, just vehicles. Commissioner Johnson also asked if the garage is actually blue on the interior, or is that just the rendering. Mr. Cutberth responded no, it is just a concrete garage; the rendering is giving it that look.

Commissioner Amorosi inquired if the employee dining space between the buildings will be constructed with the first building (Phase 1), or with the second building (Phase 2). Mr. Cutberth responded that it will be completed with the second phase, but contractually, the second building must be delivered within one year of the first. Commissioner Amorosi asked a few more questions concerning location of refuse, artwork being incorporated into the entryway, and if additional office space could be added above the garages in the future. Mr. Cutberth responded that after some discussion, the artwork is being incorporated into the multi-modal path rather than the entryway as it would be more beneficial to more people, and no additional office space could be added above the garages in the future due to structural issues.

Commissioner Sumners asked about how employees would leave the buildings to go, for example, to lunch, how would they get there? Mr. Cutberth explained, using the site plan map. It will easily be walkable and is ADA accessible as well. Ms. Kaminski explained the connections to Tempe Marketplace.

Chair Spears inquired if there is already a single-user tenant on board for this site. Mr. Cutberth affirmed that there is. There should not be a lot of visitor traffic with this tenant; it will mostly be the people working there.

Commissioner Brown stated that this is a very large project, and that the garage on the west side is huge. He was concerned that the plant life surrounding it will be well tended to, and he has a concern about the very large billboard at the site. His opinion is that overall, the applicant has done a really good job with such large plates, but the site will house more cars than typical, based on the square footage of the building. Mr. Cutberth responded that there is nothing they can do to make the billboard "go away" and he realizes the vehicle count is high, but this is what the tenant needs, ultimately the tenant chose this site over a site in Chandler.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

**COMMISSION COMMENTS:**

Commissioner Thornton thanked the applicant for what she considers a beautiful project; she likes the ten percent reflectivity glass features, and appreciates the attention to public art.

Commissioner Brown stated we know what will be developed to the west of this site, apartments and a large garage. Does the applicant know what will be developed to the east? Mr. Cutberth responded it will very likely be another office building, possibly for this tenant, and be very similar to these two office buildings.

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Commissioner Thornton to approve Development Plan Review consisting of a phased commercial office development with two four-story office buildings and parking structures for **FREEDOM RIO 2100 (PL170062)** located at 2108 East Rio Salado Parkway. Motion seconded by Commissioner Summers.

**VOTE:** Motion passes, 6-0.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS:**

Ms. Dasgupta reviewed the upcoming agenda items for May 9, 2017.

Commissioner Amorosi congratulated Commissioner Barbara Lloyd on having won the "Neighbor of the Year" award, and stated it was well-deserved.

Commissioner Brown recommended a documentary entitled "Citizen Jane" to his fellow Commissioners, as it deals with urban development and specifically the spaces between buildings.

Chair Spears wished Commissioner Thornton a safe and happy trip, as she will be traveling for the next 60 days.

**There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:09 pm.**

Prepared by: Cynthia Jarrad



Reviewed by:  
Suparna Dasgupta, Principal Planner, Community Development Planning