



Minutes City of Tempe Sustainability Commission December 10, 2018

Minutes of the Tempe Sustainability Commission meeting held on Monday, December 10, 2018, 4:30 p.m., at the Public Works Conference Room, City Hall, 31 E. 5th Street, Tempe, Arizona.

(MEMBERS) Present:

Corey Hawkey (Chair)
Kendon Jung (Vice Chair)
John F. Kane
Arnim Wiek

Gretchen Reinhardt
Alix Monty
Reyna Olvey
Ryan Mores

(MEMBERS) Absent:

Anne Gill
Stephanie Milam-Edwards

City Staff Present:

Marilyn DeRosa, Deputy Public Works Director - Engineering
Grace DelMonte Kelly, Energy Management Coordinator
Braden Kay, Sustainability Director

Guests Present:

Michael Weiss, Citizens Climate Lobby

Chair Hawkey called the meeting to order at 4:35 p.m.

Agenda Item 1 – Public Appearance

Mike Weiss introduced himself and said he is here to learn more about the commission.

Agenda Item 2 – Approval of Meeting Minutes

Chair Hawkey introduced the minutes of the November 19th meeting. Vice Chair Jung made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Mores Seconded.

Motion: Commissioner Jung

Second: Commissioner Mores

Decision: Approved 8-0, all present approved

Voted to Approve:

Corey Hawkey (Chair)

Kendon Jung (Vice Chair)
John F. Kane
Reyna Olvey
Arnim Wiek
Gretchen Reinhardt
Alix Monty
Ryan Mores

Agenda Item 3 – Chair Update

Chair Hawkey said there was no update. He thanked the commission for giving him the opportunity to be chair. He said his goal has been to refine the commission's ideas and get some things on paper. Moving forward, the more focused the commission is, the more value it will add to Mayor, Council and the city.

Agenda Item 4 – Smoke Pollution

Tempe resident Cliff Anderson said he appreciates the commission's great work on climate action and other items. He is here to speak to the commission about smoke pollution and its negative impacts on health. Maricopa County has two sensors operated by the county. If the sensors are not in an area where there are residential fires, they are going to miss it.

Cliff's observation is that a small minority of people are bad actors. Three minutes of smoke is all you need. People are burning wet wood, trash, and incorrectly burning. The clean air act was a compromise. This needs to be addressed in Tempe's climate action plan. If a resident is in violation of the ordinance, I call county and the county will not take action.

Action needed:

- Educate the public
- Install monitors
- Fireplace retrofits
- Lower threshold for HPA days
- Incorporate home heating in climate action plan

What can be done in long term:

- Restrict sale of firepits
- Require fireplace retrofit
- Burning restrictions
- Pollution tax

A commissioner asked if PM 2.5 directly correlated to residential fire place. Cliff said, yes, it is related. What are some health impacts? Respiratory affects, particularly in those with asthma. There was a paper put out by Maricopa County about climate change and public health correlate asthma with PM 2.5.

A commissioner asked how it is currently regulated and what Cliff proposes? It is regulated by EPA. Cliff said the city could add low cost sensors, for \$220 per sensor, or could work with county to add more sensors.

Commissioners asked what is the relationship between Maricopa County and the City of Tempe? Braden said most of this is enforced by the county. Some can be enforced by city staff. If you want to lean more on this, we have a city air quality person. Oddvar Tveit in Environmental Services could come present on what he does, what he monitors,

and we could also bring in staff from Maricopa County. Staff will request Oddvar Tveit present to the commission at the January meeting.

Agenda Item 5 – Equity in Action Update

Braden Kay said the city received innovation funding to engage with nonprofits to try and reach Tempe's vulnerable populations. He said they met a group of stakeholders that have been meeting since early summer and that they have representatives from Police, Strategic Management and Diversity, Neighborhood Services, Human Services, and TCC. They are helping us to define the definition of diversity and help us to bring on organizations to help with equity in action.

Initially we thought we would copy Portland, who brought in 5 organizations and gave them each \$5,000. The more we've been going through the process with the procurement office, the more we feel it is limited and may not include those who may want to be involved. We are partnering with groups that are good at working with vulnerable populations, and then we could figure out how to proceed.

We are asking who is not thriving in Tempe. Try to figure out how can we make sure those voices are heard. So, through that we've been focusing efforts on North Tempe, neighborhoods on the west side of the city, east side of the city, looking at community partners to find organizations that might be appropriate for this work.

We're meeting with the group again on Friday and I hope to bring you a draft next month. The Vitalist Health Foundation has hired individuals to help us. Some think that we need to address internal diversity work first. But that's not what we got funding for and scope from council, so we are trying to balance the needs of what has come up from city staff as to what the needs are as we go through this climate action work. The main way the commission can help is to respond to the draft in January.

Commissioners asked Braden about the groups that have been identified. A lot of them have been schools; after-school programs and community centers have been highly engaged in this process.

Other suggestions from to commission were to consider homeless, LGBTQ community, those in recovery from addiction, gig economy workers/underemployed, and undocumented immigrants.

Braden said programs around the country that have been really successful focus on race. The idea is that if you cover race, you will pick up other inequities. Yes, there's gender inequality, there's economic inequality, but the one that is most deeply rooted is race, so unless you tackle race, you won't see change. It is clear to me that the city has been working for a decade with vulnerable communities. They know what to communicate, how to navigate, it gives me a sense of how far we want to go. Tempe prides itself on being inclusive and there is more work to be done. Braden thanked the commission for their feedback.

Agenda Item 6 – Update on Climate Action Plan

Braden said that over the Fall, we have been working on our Climate Action Plan. We had forums on energy and transportation. For transportation, we had a forum and a joint meeting with the sustainability commission. We had an expert forum with energy and transportation. We had a public forum for transportation and we will have one for energy in Spring.

We are doing the climate action plan as part of our commitment with the compact of mayors. We did a community greenhouse gas emissions inventory. Transportation emissions are one-half of our emissions. We are going to wait to do water and waste and just focus on energy and transportation. Our climate mitigation will be on transportation and energy.

How are commercial and industrial emissions calculated? These inventories are rough approximations. The only way energy emissions get better is if utilities clean up their grid. EPA has a co-efficient that tells you how clean your grid is based on how much coal you have, how much gas, and what your mix is. Mix times usage gives you how much emissions you have. We got APS and SRP data, what their industrial customers used, what their residential customers used. Next, we will look at 2020 data. A cleaner grid would ideally shrink this pie.

A commissioner asked wouldn't it be helpful to show the utilities as energy is the other half of this pie? Braden said this is what is going to CDP and is the product they ask for. The challenge is having these conversations and acknowledge the role the utility plays without demonizing them. Orlando hired a community energy manager. How do we move from a municipal based to community energy?

A commissioner said a major lever for this work is carbon pricing and maybe we can revisit that as part of this conversation.

Braden said this is the work we have been doing. We're setting a goal for community wide energy reduction. This is the timeline, in winter we will do a forum on extreme heat.

In the energy work, we have three key ideas/strategies:

- Financing energy efficiency
- Supporting renewable energy
- Business engagement

We've been advancing those conversations and we've been working with APS and SRP. We were not eligible for the utility scale that SRP is offering at this time, we don't have facilities large enough. We are coming up with a strategy for 10% renewable energy from one area, 10% from another, and 80% in another.

Braden said Flagstaff just put out an RFP to cover all city facilities with solar. They can't use that solar without APS interconnection so they put out RFP for 100% municipal energy to come from a solar project on Hopi Land. We can only take approaches that will have 4 votes from council. As we've been working with APS, we've had conversations at the highest levels to figure out how to articulate that urgency. There's not a lot the city can do to force APS. The forces are the ACC and the Governor, they are outside of our control. What we struggle with is that our urgency to act could put us into a contract that was a bad contract/rates/terms.

The commission discussed ideas including the energy code, new technologies and carbon pricing. A graduate student will be putting on a solutions forum to discuss how cities can implement internal carbon pricing. ASU started with air travel and new buildings. Cities could start with air travel and buildings, then they could take on water. There are different ways to do it.

Ann Arbor is interested in raising revenue for sustainability efforts. Vancouver is the only city that has internal carbon pricing. In Phoenix, there are so many investments to reduce carbon, we just need to make investments. Vancouver spent a lot of time and energy and we were able to fund one extra thing. It did not have as dramatic an effect on budget making decisions as we thought it would. We have to think about how we motivate the community goals. We could create an online platform. There's a lot of resources necessary. There's a lot of space to think about it. A commissioner said we have a carbon pricing bill in the house.

Braden said he is going to council on Thursday to put forward several proposals including a readiness guide for AVs and he said we are a finalist for a prize with a google affiliate to look at using WAYMO for transportation options. For EVs there were strong discussions with utilities and there's a lot of opportunities in this space.

Agenda Item 7 – Proposal for Calendar for 2019

January - review transportation program and investments
February - review transportation program and investments
March - review extreme heat program investments
April – review draft plan
May - review climate action plan 2.0 principles
Summer – equity in action, drought resiliency, and engagement and outreach plan
Fall 2019 - council adoption

The idea is there would be a letter of support from the commission for this plan. This is just our first plan. It is setting a baseline. We should do a second climate action plan based on 2020 data. There are emerging themes like entrepreneurship, equity / inclusion. They are not at the heart of this first climate action plan. Air quality would be another emerging theme that needs to be central to this work.

How do we make sure the city is putting in resources to make sure the city has performance measures for carbon and extreme heat? My concern is that we need to clearly communicate where we see this trajectory going.

Commissioners discussed that this is a lot of work, that meeting two hours a month may not get this done. Vice Chair Jung said in the past, we have had sub-committees. There was a conversation about subcommittees is it takes resources away. We may need to have a discussion on what our priorities are and make that an agenda item.

One commissioner asked about sharing resources, if I read a great article about carbon pricing, how do we share that so we are not breaking the rules. Staff offered to bring the clerk in for discussion

Agenda Item 8 – Housekeeping Items

Braden presented a certificate of appreciation to Alix Monty and thanked Alix, especially for being chair of the water subcommittee. The recommendation letter still guides discussion around water. Braden said we all enjoyed working with you and appreciate your service.

Braden presented a certificate of appreciate to Chair Corey Hawkey.

Chair Hawkey gave anecdotes for reasons to be optimistic:

- We hear reports that we have 12 years to get this ship righted, but in the news, coal plants are running at a loss
- Chevron has invested 200 million dollars in ChargePoint electric vehicle charging stations
- Shell wants to see their executive leadership measured by their carbon reduction
- Excel energy in Colorado is the first multi-state utility to commit to carbon free energy by 2050

It's going to be a whole different world and I believe we can all be optimistic

As a commission, if you keep that in mind and stay focused and keep the city on point it will help city be on pace. There's a brighter future ahead.

With that, Chair Hawkey asked who would like to throw their hat in for Chair. Vice Chair Jung said he was interested.

Commissioner Kane made a motion to appoint Commissioner Jung as Chair.
Commissioner Reinhardt seconded the motion.

There was discussion about criteria, Chair duties, terms of one or two years and other roles/duties of the chair.

Motion: Commissioner Kane

Second: Commissioner Reinhardt

Decision: Approved 8-0, all present approved

Voted to Approve:

Corey Hawkey (Chair)

Kendon Jung (Vice Chair)

John F. Kane

Reyna Olvey

Annim Wiek

Gretchen Reinhardt

Alix Monty

Ryan Mores

Ryan Mores said he was interested in the role of Vice Chair and agreed with commissioners' earlier comments that the Vice Chair should be more involved.

Motion: Commissioner Mores

Second: Commissioner Kane

Decision: Approved 8-0, all present approved

Voted to Approve:

Corey Hawkey

Kendon Jung (Chair)

John F. Kane

Reyna Olvey

Annim Wiek

Gretchen Reinhardt

Alix Monty

Ryan Mores

Agenda Item 9 – Future Agenda Items

Clerk will come and talk to commission about rules once new commissioners are seated

Priorities / Strategies for priorities next year – game plan

Plan a retreat

A motion was made to adjourn.

Motion: Chair Jung

Second: Commissioner Monty

Decision: Approved 8-0, all present approved

Meeting adjourned at 6:35 pm.

Prepared by: Grace DelMonte Kelly

Reviewed by: Braden Kay