



## Minutes Tempe Aviation Commission March 12, 2019

Minutes of the Tempe Aviation Commission meeting held on March 12, 2019, 6:30 p.m., at the Public Works Conference Room, Garden Level, City Hall Complex, 31 E. Fifth Street, Tempe, Arizona.

**(MEMBERS) Present:**

Robert Dixon  
W. David Doiron  
Shannon Dutton  
Gordon Gauss  
Valeriy Khaldarov  
John Q. Nunes (Chair)  
Trevor Pan  
Peter Schelstraete

**(MEMBERS) Absent:**

Lane Carraway (Excused)

**Citizens Present:**

Keo Van Riper  
Kimberly Van Riper

**City Staff Present:**

Oddvar Tveit, *Environmental Quality Specialist*

**Agenda Item 1 – Call to Order**

Chairman Mr. John Q. Nunes called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

**Agenda Item 2 – Public Appearances**

Ms. Kimberly Van Riper, speaking on behalf of herself and Mr. Keo van Riper, residents from northwest E. Lehi Road and Mesa Drive in the City of Mesa, informed the members about a substantial increase in air traffic over their home beginning in September 2018 with some planes flying as low as 3,000 feet. PHX officials have told her that no changes were made to the routing of aircraft, but she is skeptical and searching for reasons for the change that happened in 2014, when a large volume of aircraft started to appear over their house at low altitudes. The approaching aircraft appear to be taking short cuts and divert from the published flight paths. Arrivals on the BRUSR One RNAV STAR (coming in from north over the downwind leg) and EAGUL SIX RNAV STAR from the north east are affecting homes in a community with roots going back to 1947 in northwest Mesa. The BROAK ONE RNAV SID appears to have increased the flow of departures over the same area in the mornings and the FORP ONE RNAV SID is also adding to the impacts of morning departure noise due to the navigation computer software in some aircraft cannot turn the aircraft north directly after reaching the SPARKY waypoint as intended in the published SID. Two and a half years ago, planes were rarely seen over their home.

Commissioner comments:

- Approaching aircraft should at least be above 4,000 feet at that point, or they would need to add power to return to the appropriate approach altitude.
- Southwest approaches tend to deploy flaps and add power on their final descents over north Tempe.
- The Commission has recommended to the city that an office be created to deal with flight procedures and noise abatement which other cities can join.

**Agenda Item 3 – Consideration of Meeting Minutes (February 12, 2019)**

Chairman John Q. Nunes asked for a motion to approve the drafted February 12, 2019 meeting minutes.

**Motion:** Ms. Shannon Dutton moved to approve. Mr. Robert Dixon seconded the motion. Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov moved to amend the motion to approve the minutes and include a summary attachment he had drafted after the February 12, 2019 meeting which had been distributed to the members with the drafted minutes prior to meeting. Mr. Peter Schelstraete seconded the amended motion to approve the minutes as draft with the summary attached.

**Action:** The motion to approve the February 12, 2019 minutes as drafted with the summary included as an attachment carried by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Mr. Robert Dixon, Mr. W. David Doiron, Ms. Shannon Dutton, Mr. Gordon Gauss, Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov, Mr. John Q. Nunes, Mr. Trevor Pan and Mr. Peter Schelstraete. Abstentions: None Nays: None. Absent: Mr. Lane Carraway.

#### **Agenda Item 4 – Update from staff**

*The PHX Comprehensive Asset Management Plan (CAMP) Public Meeting:* A public meeting is scheduled in Phoenix on March 20, 2019 where the airport will present existing plans and future development scenarios for PHX. Mr. Oddvar Tveit accounted briefly about elements in the plan:

- Already planned and future alternatives for terminal capacity improvements.
- Consolidation of cargo operations, potential utilization of properties acquired on the north side of the South Pacific Railroad alignment.
- Facilitate expansion needs for the Air National Guard air tanker fleet on the south side.
- Improve roadway access and reduce PHX through traffic. Establish security plaza entry points on both sides of the airport.

*UC Davis Noise & Emissions Symposium:* Mr. Oddvar Tveit reported from the annual symposiums where representatives from airport noise offices, aviation agencies, universities, airport community groups, vendors of airport noise and flight tracking applications meet. He covered the following topics:

1. Airspace Modernization & A More Sustainable Future:
  - Environmental targets for air traffic, flight delay reduction results in fuel burn savings.
  - New air traffic management tools to see air traffic conflicts ahead of time.
  - UK's Independent Commission on Civil Aircraft Noise (ICCAN). Noise Ombudsman. The French authority for airport nuisance control, ACNUSA is a separate authority with powers to enforce airport impact mitigation measures and air traffic environmental restrictions, airport curfews etc.
  - PBN Opportunities: Share routes over a wider area, route aircraft over rural areas and accurately over urban areas Protect parks and quiet spaces. Prioritize noise over CO2 emissions in lower airspace. Use multiple PBN routes and turn on-and off routes at different time of day
2. Performance Based Navigation – The reach for higher precision.
  - New York Complex – Use of Performance Based Navigation (PBN) to disperse and ease the noise impact. Use JFK night -time Optimal Profile Descent (OPD) procedures to avoid low approaches. Plan to give all airports GLS approach capabilities. GLS is the landing system for Global Navigation Satellite System (GNSS).
  - Terminal Sequencing and Spacing (TESAS) tool to improve arrival flows. Currently in use at PHX which increases precision of time-based spacing, reducing the likelihood of low altitude delay vectors needed to achieve runway separation.
3. Performance Based Navigation – Tailored to meet community concerns.
  - Hybrid RNAV SIDs with initial ATC vectors to disperse initial departure climbs over a wider area.
  - Required Navigation Performance (RNP) - Authorization Required (AR) procedures to bend approach paths away from populated areas or shorten finals to avoid a community.
  - Established On RNP (EOR) procedures reduce the number of low approaches to final and give lower emissions.
  - Have different RNPs at nights to get concentrations away from people and direct traffic over highways where noise levels already are high.
4. The Community Perspective

- The symposium host, UC Davis, had prior to the event asked community participants to identify a preferred community engagement process for NextGen PBN Development and Implementation in advance of a scheduled community workshop at the symposium. Staff provided information about the work of the Tempe Aviation Commission and its recommendation to establish a forum (NAO) staffed with aviation and air traffic expertise that could serve as a competent and trustworthy communication link between the FAA and the communities around PHX.
- At the community workshop representatives from airport roundtables and other community noise groups agreed that the FAA should follow a comprehensive public consultation process for NextGen air traffic planning, irrespective of current NEPA regulations and FAA guidance for which proposed airspace actions need to be subject to environmental reviews. They also argued for a more democratic representation of communities on the NextGen Advisory Committee (NAC).

#### 5. Initiatives

- The FAA's office of Environment and Energy reported that the annoyance survey is being evaluated and included 10,000 responses. The results will be released next year. The agency works in cooperation with MIT and Massachusetts Port Authority (Massport) on research of sleep disturbance, cardiovascular health and noise abatement around airports.
- The Transportation Research Board ACRP – Airport Cooperative Research Program, has funded research aimed at developing guidance documents to airport planners about how to archive zero emissions, including accounting for direct and indirect emissions from airport operations. Pilot testing at three airports are planned to start after completing a guidebook. Existing guidance, ACRP 02-80, helps airports to quantify emissions reductions from the airlines using of alternative fuels and help to estimate potential PM<sub>2.5</sub>, NO<sub>x</sub>, SO<sub>x</sub>, and HAP emissions reductions by the use alternative jet fuels.
- FAA Reauthorization Act of 2018: Includes provision for FAA to study on health impacts and alternatives to current noise metrics, consider the use of diverging departure flight paths or lateral spacing to address community noise concerns, designate a noise ombudsman for each region and revisit airport land use compatibility guidelines. Activities partly underway. The legislation also appropriated \$3.35 billion to AIP NextGen priorities.

The account was flowed by comments from the members about airport administrations that have managed to establish productive communications with the FAA to establish noise abatement measures that are respected by both private pilots and the airlines, and the practice of clearing aircraft under visual meteorological conditions most of the year at PHX has not made the airport conducive ideas about new RNP's that may be designed to help reduce noise. With more intricate instrument flight procedures in and out of an airport, options of applying visual separation between aircraft close to the runways have been limited. At PHX air traffic throughput during peak hours are significantly reduced during instrument weather conditions.

#### **Agenda Item 5 – Annual Compliance & Noise Report**

Mr. Oddvar Tveit presented a requested report about last quarter 4-DME gate compliance data with and without departures that were exempted because of adverse weather conditions. The City of Phoenix Aviation have criteria for when whether conditions are likely to cause departure deviations and the affected departure times are e-mailed to staff to be included in Tempe's quarterly reports. He reported that the 4-DME gate jet departure compliance rate of 99.4% for the last quarter of 2018 was reduced by 0.3% with the inclusion of weather-exempted departure times.

Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov had prepared a memo where he updated a summary that members voted to attach to the February 12, 2019 meeting minutes. Chairman John Q. Nunes interceded that the members were unable to discuss the updated memo presented because it had not been distributed by staff prior to the meeting.

Mr. Oddvar Tveit stated that the topics for discussion are the elements in the Tempe report, which is currently structured to reflect how the operations at PHX comply with the noise mitigation flight procedures agreed upon in the 1994 IGA with the City of Phoenix with accounts for aircraft noise exposure and received aircraft noise complaints by

the City of Tempe. Complaints by Tempe residents to the airport are handled by the City of Phoenix and have not been accounted for in the Tempe report, but are publicly available in the airport's published annual noise reports, <https://www.skyharbor.com/FlightPaths/NoiseReports>.

**Motion:** Robert Dixon moved to accept the staff report. Ms. Shannon Dutton seconded the motion.

**Action:** The motion carried by seven votes. Ayes: Mr. Robert Dixon, Mr. W. David Doiron, Ms. Shannon Dutton, Mr. Gordon Gauss, Mr. John Q. Nunes, Mr. Trevor Pan and Mr. Peter Schelstraete. Abstentions: None Nays: Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov. Absent: Mr. Lane Carraway.

#### **Agenda Item 6 – Public Aviation Meeting in Tempe in 2019**

The meeting room schedule for the Tempe Council Chambers, preferred location for a future public aviation meeting in Tempe was made available to the members prior to the meeting.

**Motion:** Mr. Robert Dixon moved that staff check the availability of the council chambers in the evening of Wednesday, June 19, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. W. David Doiron.

**Action:** The motion carried by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Mr. Robert Dixon, Mr. W. David Doiron, Ms. Shannon Dutton, Mr. Gordon Gauss, Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov, Mr. John Q. Nunes, Mr. Trevor Pan and Mr. Peter Schelstraete. Abstentions: None Nays: None. Absent: Mr. Lane Carraway.

#### **Agenda Item 7 – Commissioners' business**

- Accounts for complaints and other disclosures in the Tempe annual compliance and noise report.  
**Motion:** Ms. Shannon Dutton moved to set a discussion time limit for this topic before the topic is addressed that need to be respected. The motion was seconded by Mr. Robert Dixon.  
**Action:** The motion carried by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Mr. Robert Dixon, Mr. W. David Doiron, Ms. Shannon Dutton, Mr. Gordon Gauss, Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov, Mr. John Q. Nunes, Mr. Trevor Pan and Mr. Peter Schelstraete. Abstentions: None Nays: None. Absent: Mr. Lane Carraway.
- Staff update on date and time and discussion of preparatory actions needed for a public aviation meeting in Tempe.
- At a future meeting get airline representatives to come and talk about the Tempe community's contributions to airline operations at Phoenix.

#### **Agenda Item 8 – Schedule next TAVCO meeting**

The next meeting was scheduled for April 9, 2019.

#### **Agenda Item 9 – Adjournment**

**Motion:** Mr. Robert Dixon moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Gordon Gauss seconded the motion.

**Action:** The meeting was adjourned at 7:59 p.m. by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Mr. Robert Dixon, Mr. W. David Doiron, Ms. Shannon Dutton, Mr. Gordon Gauss, Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov, Mr. John Q. Nunes, Mr. Trevor Pan and Mr. Peter Schelstraete. Abstentions: None Nays: None. Absent: Mr. Lane Carraway.

Prepared by: Oddvar Tveit

Reviewed by: Justin Bern