



Minutes Tempe Aviation Commission May 14, 2019

Minutes of the Tempe Aviation Commission meeting held on May 14, 2019, 6:30 p.m., at the Engineering & Transportation Conference Room, Garden Level, City Hall Complex, 31 E. Fifth Street, Tempe, Arizona.

(MEMBERS) Present:

Lane Carraway (Vice Chair)
W. David Doiron
Shannon Dutton
Gordon Gauss (on phone)
Valeriy Khaldarov
Trevor Pan
Peter Schelstraete

(MEMBERS) Absent:

Robert Dixon (Excused)
John Q. Nunes

City Staff Present:

Oddvar Tveit, *Environmental Quality Specialist*

Agenda Item 1 – Call to Order

Vice Chairman Lane Carraway called the meeting to order at 6:35 p.m.

Agenda Item 2 – Public Appearances

There were no public appearances.

Agenda Item 3 – Consideration of Meeting Minutes (April 9, 2019)

Chairman John Q. Nunes asked for any comments on the drafted April 9, 2019 meeting minutes and a motion to approve. Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov commented on the drafted minutes page 3 where the draft states that no additional written comments were received by staff prior to the April meeting. He submitted written comments to staff on the annual report discussion topic in February 2019. Mr. Lane Carraway inquired if that meant the minutes needed to be amended. Chairman John Q. Nunes stated that the drafted minutes gave a correct account of April meeting proceedings, which refers to the requirement set by the Commission for further discussion at the April meeting of the same topic that was addressed by Mr. Khaldarov at the March meeting.

Motion: Ms. Shannon Dutton moved to approve the minutes as drafted. Mr. Lane Carraway seconded the motion.

Action: The motion to approve the drafted April 9, 2019 minutes carried by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Mr. Lane Carraway, Mr. Robert Dixon, Mr. W. David Doiron, Ms. Shannon Dutton, Mr. Gordon Gauss, Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov, Mr. John Q. Nunes, Mr. Trevor Pan and Mr. Peter Schelstraete. Abstentions: None. Nays: None. Absent: None.

Agenda Item 4 – The Noise Abatement Office Recommendation

Ms. Rosa Inchausti addressed recent changes to the city's public works organization, it has been split in two, with water, solid waste and fleet management in one department and engineering and transportation in another department. She explained how recommendations from commissions, whose members are appointed by the Mayor with Council approval in an advisory capacity to the City Council, routinely are directed to the City Manager who, with the Council's approval, schedules a meeting where the recommendation can be presented.

In this case, the Commission's recommendation was forwarded to the Public Works director in 2017 and after making inquiries the Commission was advised to file a supplemental budget request to staff the office the Commission had recommended be created. The Water Utilities, who staffs the Commission, prepared the request for the Commission.

She recommended that the Commission discuss addressing the recommendation directly to the Mayor and Council without putting additional work into the recommendation.

Ms. Rosa Inchausti and Holly Rosenthal both apologized for the long delay and handling of the Commission's recommendation.

Discussion:

- The members got the impression from the previous public works management that the supplemental budget route was a test case and it was a low possibility that City Council would agree to appropriate money to staff the recommended Noise Abatement Office.
- The recommendation could go to a work-study session to start a conversation with the City Council to help the Council understand what the Commission is recommending and about finding resources within the city.
- The City should have better guidance for processing recommendations.
- The Commission could include a summary of the history or synopsis of what has transpired after the recommendation was made in 2017.
- The Commission had a situation prior to the recommendation where a letter drafted by a member and approved by the Commission to be forwarded for City's review and submittal to the FAA was reworked by the attorney's office and delayed. A letter from the City was time-sensitive because the member who proposed a letter had assurances that the FAA Administrator Michael Huerta was open to request from communities like Tempe to become a stakeholder in FAA NextGen development of area (RNAV) routing at PHX. The city sent a letter, but it was not consistent with the language the Commission wanted to submit.
- Staff will follow up and have conversations with the City Manager to get the recommendation of the Council's agenda.

Chairman Mr. John Q. Nunes suggested that staff could include the appropriate wording necessary to bring the recommendation to the Mayor and Council without the need for further action by the Commission.

Motion: Ms. Shannon Dutton moved to give staff the task to readdress the recommendation. The motion was seconded by Mr. David Doiron. Mr. Trevor Pan suggested an amendment to the motion to have staff include a short synopsis of the recommendation's history.

Discussion:

Several members doubted how productive the inclusion of a synopsis of what has transpired after the recommendation was made in 2017 would be in the effort to fast track it to the Mayor and Council.

Action: The motion passed by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Mr. Lane Carraway, Mr. Robert Dixon, Mr. W. David Doiron, Ms. Shannon Dutton, Mr. Gordon Gauss, Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov, Mr. John Q. Nunes, Mr. Trevor Pan and Mr. Peter Schelstraete. Abstentions: None. Nays: None. Absent: None.

Agenda Item 5 – FAA Community Involvement Workshops

Mr. Oddvar Tveit reported from FAA's Community Involvement workshops in May 2019 held in cooperation with the City of Phoenix. He had attended workshops in Ahwatukee and Laveen, which had posters showing flight tracks before and after the implementation of the Step 1 agreement. This agreement was made between the petitioners in Phoenix v. Huerta in March and May 2018 where FAA made changes to west bound departure heading to reflect heading in place before September 18, 2014. The public had the opportunity to ask questions and complete public comment forms about what actions they would like the FAA to take under Step 2 of the agreement. A drafted form with comments was included in the meeting material. It was built on comments submitted by the City during Step 1, the main issues being:

- a) The lack of routing predictability inside the PHX terminal area particularly with the regards to the vectoring of aircraft to final approach bring planes over neighborhoods at multiple locations in Tempe and at various altitudes during busy hours.
- b) The prospect to including procedures that increase the use of advanced NextGen routing technology that can provide noise reduction benefits at PHX
- c) Ease the concentration of routes in areas of southeast Tempe.

Ms. Shannon Dutton reported from the FAA Workshop in Ahwatukee and about her efforts to persuade Mr. Perry Clausen, the manager for air traffic at Southwest Airlines to attend the public meeting in June 2019. She emphasized the importance of making sure invitees are informed about all questions at the meeting and the need to go through the meeting moderator to the invited guests. The purpose is to share information. She informed the members about the FAA's web site where the workshop poster [displays](#) are accessible and also the public comment [form](#). She directed the members attention to two concepts for rerouting optimizations at PHX. The members discussed:

- Display # 21, FAA Concept 1, new departure route (SID) that split northeast after 4-DME. It was displayed with a runway heading off the north runway, and not a converging 0.80° heading from 1550' altitude on all classic SIDs and to waypoints at and shortly after 4-DME on all RNAV SIDs.
- Display # 22, FAA Concept 2, replacing main northeastern arrival route (STAR) on east flow with two new arrival routes, one to the north downwind leg and the other with a descent just north of Tempe to the downwind leg on the southwest side of the airport.

Ms. Shannon Dutton encouraged the members to file their own comment forms before the May 23, 2019 deadline.

Agenda Item 6 – FAA Public Aviation Meeting

Mr. Oddvar Tveit presented potential participation and draft agenda for a public meeting June 19th, 2019 in the City Council Chambers, with a questionnaire for residents to complete before the opening of the meeting. With input from Chairman John Q Nunes and Mr. W. David Doiron, the moderator selected by the members, staff proposed the following topics residents would be invited to focus on in written questions:

First point on the agenda would be introductions, information about the commissions and presentations allowing for opening statements by the invited guests. Suggested topics:

- 1) Tempe/Phoenix Intergovernmental Agreement on Noise Mitigation Flight Procedures
- 2) Arrival operations, air traffic flow management close to PHX
- 3) Air traffic route congestion in south Tempe

Item # 1 would include a brief introduction of the 1994 agreement and relate to how the agreement is implemented and how the agreed upon procedures are compiled with and accounted for in published noise reports. Item # 2 is about aircraft noise related to the sequencing arrivals to a final approach at PHX, and if changes to arrival route collection points could help run approaches at PHX in a more orderly fashion during busy hours giving airlines more options to use less noisy Optimized Profile Descents to PHX. Item # 3 is about the potential of providing air traffic relief to areas of south Tempe where routes for departures with aircraft making sharp turns back west on east flow and arrival descents concentrate large volumes of air traffic on west flow. A draft questionnaire about flight tracks to visualize issues in Tempe airspace for residents to complete prior to and before the opening of the meeting was explained.

Discussion:

- If residents fill out and submit a questionnaire before the meeting, the moderator could use those to start off his questions to the panelists.
- Residents who submit questions and give their names to the Commission for the public record need to have their questions included in the meeting minutes.
- The commission should include a question to the FAA official(s) from the FAA regarding runway use and under what circumstances air traffic flow is changed east or west.

- The event will begin as a regular meeting with introduction from the Chair about the Commission and then establish meeting ground rules. He will be helping staff to collate written questions.

Agenda Item 7 – Commissioners’ business

- Update and status on staff’s preparations to have the Noise Abatement Office (NAO) recommendation go to the Mayor and Council.
- Review of the June 19, 2019 public aviation meeting.

Agenda Item 8 – Schedule next TAVCO meeting

The next meeting was scheduled for July 9, 2019.

Agenda Item 9 – Adjournment

Motion: Mr. Peter Schelstraete moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Lane Carraway seconded the motion.

Action: The meeting was adjourned at 7:25 p.m. by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Mr. Lane Carraway, Mr. Robert Dixon, Mr. W. David Doiron, Ms. Shannon Dutton, Mr. Gordon Gauss, Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov, Mr. John Q. Nunes, Mr. Trevor Pan and Mr. Peter Schelstraete. Abstentions: None. Nays: None. Absent: None.

Prepared by: Oddvar Tveit

Reviewed by: Justin Bern