

MINUTES

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

OCTOBER 16, 2019

Minutes of the regular hearing of the Historic Preservation commission, of the City of Tempe, which was held at the Hatton Hall, 34 East Seventh Street, Tempe, Arizona.

Regular Meeting 6:03 PM

Present:	Staff:
Chuck Buss, Chair	Chad Weaver, Community Development Director
Christopher Garraty	John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer
Matthew Bilsbarrow	Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner
Jim Garrison	Ambika Adhikari, Principal Planner
Laurene Montero	
Elizabeth Gilbert	
Greg Larson	
Joe Nucci	

- 1) **Call to Audience:** Persons wishing to address the Commission on any matter may do so at the discretion of the Chair. However, Arizona Open Meeting Law limits Commission discussion to matters listed on the posted agenda. Other topics may be placed on a future agenda for discussion.

- 2) Voting of the Meeting Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Bilsbarrow to approve the Meeting Minutes of September 11, 2019; second by Commissioner Garrison. Motion passed on 8-0 vote.

Ayes: Chuck Buss, Christopher Garraty, Matthew Bilsbarrow, Jim Garrison, Laurene Montero, Elizabeth Gilbert, Greg Larson, Joe Nucci

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Martin Ball

- 3) Review and possible action on proposed Urban Core Master Plan/TOD/General Plan Amendment

Presentation by Staff, Chad Weaver, and Ambika Adhikari

Mr. Weaver informed the Commissioners that they are back to give updates to the presentation from the previous suggestions that were given. In terms of timeline for the Urban Core Master Plan Staff has had there first meeting

and the second meeting will be on October 17, 2019. City staff have asked that the City Council put the second item off till February 2020. This will help give the staff more time to vet the bonus program.

Mr. Adhikari informed the Commissioners that he a few updates. One being that the historical outcome has expanded. The staff did take direction from the Commissioners suggestion and revised the setbacks on historical properties. There is also language about structures that are 50 years or older. Mr. Adhikari went over the guidelines that will be used to determine access what is historical and what will be used to reference the code. Mr. Smith informed the commissioners that the goal is to have the assessment at least 5 years ahead. Mr. Adhikari showed the Commissioners of proposed plans and what the set backs will look like and the renderings.

Commission Discussion

Chair Buss asked if Mr. Adhikari is aware of the depths of any of the building on Mill Ave.

Staff stated that most of the properties go back about 50 feet.

Commissioners asked if there are going to be any archaeology resources integrated into the plan.

Mr. Adhikari stated that Urban Core Master Plan is for guidelines and does not go into a lot of details on archaeology. The Urban Core Master Plan is more on heights. However, the historical guidelines do talk about design.

Commissioners asked if there was any intent to develop a plan that considers archaeology.

Mr. Southard stated it may be in the Urban Core Master Plan however it can be something that is looked at in the bonus program with what they are developing it will have contributing factors, but it is not a protocol for what is required.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Bilsbarrow.

Commissioner Bilsbarrow stated he would like to point out that in the bonus points staff is talking about registered preserve to be eligible or National registered historic place listed properties. The city is not confining itself to what property type so it could also include archaeological sites. That may not be the intent or was thought in that way. Also, in the past on lots before they were redeveloped for instance where Gordon Biersch used to be sat the John Armstrong house and the building used to be determined that it was not eligible and was torn down but when they went to build on it was determined to be an archaeological site and was determined eligible. There was an archaeological excavation which uncovered the foundation of the Armstrong house as well as the privy in the backyard. There may be a situation where the building in a spot there is archaeology and the developers are going to be asked what to do about it and the Commissioners would like to see an incentive for the developers to do something. Also, the implementing of the inventory ahead of time will need to have an archaeology sensitivity layer in it. There won't be time to assess the parcels ahead of time.

Mr. Smith stated that the 100 mill citizens were asked to negotiate a term of development agreement that area may not be able to be replicated but most of the developers coming in they are looking at the bonus program in the future even if they were going to restore and rehabilitate a building they are still doing it for a revenue for the building.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Nucci.

Commissioner Nucci stated that 15 percent of Tempe's land area is known to be archaeology sensitive to date so there is only 44 miles which leaves 1 in 6 chance that it is an archaeologically sensitive area. Of which staff has tried to balance the rights of the Native American Community and the Land owners so the statue does not come in till there is human remains discovered. Where if a developer waits till they find human remains then they may lose their funds. Knowing that going in is one more cost to be calculated into what the project will bear.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Bilbarrow.

Commissioner Bilbarrow stated the statue that Commissioner Nucci is referring to is the burial law and the respectful treatment of human remains. The fact that archaeologists do it is a bonus and the archaeologists get to study and exam but that is not required. However, what he is talking about is Tempe history and historical archaeology and specially about the development of Tempe. The Commissioners have been very supportive of the archaeological monitoring going on at Monti's. Monti's is not the property that is getting covered by the statue.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Montero.

Commissioner Montero stated that in order to identify where the human remains are one would have to look at other archaeology to determine where the other burials might be. It would be in the best insert of any project to look at the archaeology up front.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Garrison.

Commissioner Garrison stated that in the handout it talks about preservation or rehabilitated of treatments. Renovate and rehabilitated is the same treatment. The treatments need to be aligned.

Mr. Adhikari stated that they can provided more comments or unclear thoughts to himself, Robbie Aaron, or Mr. Southard.

Public Comments

Citizen from the audience stated to the Commissioners that they have been working with the City staff and have modified the document with the suggestions, and guidelines. They reduced the frontage building requirements. There are two issues remaining. For the historic core the major concern is to keep the scale which is something that has been affect for the last 40 years on Mill Ave. There tend to be no building between 4th and 6th street on Mill that are more then 2-3 stories in respect for the scale and character. In the report it allows 30-foot setbacks for historic properties. Would like to see the same 30 foot applied to non-historic properties in the downtown Tempe area. The second point is that if the developer chooses to not opt in and go the PAD route. Under the current plan they can go up to 160 feet the entire length of Mill Ave. Would like to see a reduction in that.

Mr. Adhikari stated that citizens need to keep in mind that the TOD has a set of requirements and allow for certain zoning rights.

Mr. Weaver stated that the 30 feet is in the document based on the need that some buildings are being persevered to make sure that a minimum of 30 feet of the building will be preserved before they build up the new building.

Chair Buss asked Mr. Adhikari if there was only one station area.

Mr. Adhikari stated that there is only one station area. Also, the UCMP has a code that if it gets adopted and people want to opt in then they can only do 90 feet otherwise the city can not ask for them to keep it under 90 feet.

Chair Buss asked if there is any thought to letting them have what they want in terms of height if the developer was to preserve the entire building and a small buffer behind it.

Mr. Weaver stated that yeah if they preserve the whole thing then yes, they can build as tall as the want. There is hope that if putting it in the document it will cause some developers to do that. However, it is an option not something that the City can control.

Public Comments Closed

Motion: Comm. Joe Nucci motioned the Tempe Historic Preservation Commission supports the Urban Code District and General Plan Amendment, and all related documents subject to the setbacks being set at 30 feet and that the building height for construction be limited to 130 feet. As well as process all the documents for the Urban Core Master plan be submitted as one to ensure that everything remains constant. And to provide HPC with additional information regarding the bonus program and how it will work, and points will transfer. Comm. Matthew Bilsbarrow seconded the motion.

Vote: 9-0

Ayes: Comm. Charles Ball, Comm. Matthew Bilsbarrow, Comm. Christopher Garraty, Comm. James Garrison, Comm. Elizabeth Gilbert, Comm. Gregory Larson, Comm. Laurene Montero, Comm. Chuck Buss, and Comm. Joe Nucci.

Nays: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: None.

4) Review calendar for 2020/2021 meeting dates

Chair Buss stated that it looks the dates are the same as what they have been doing in the past with the expectation of April and November.

Presentation by Staff, Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner

Mr. Abrahamson stated that the yellow areas on the handout are the ones in which the Commission can not meet due to faith-based holiday calendar that the city has established. So, it is indicated that April 29, 2020 and November 18, 2020 can be the dates that the commissioners meet instead of the second Wednesday of the month.

Chair Buss asked how did the April one land so far in the month.

Mr. Abrahamson stated it was due to the holidays of Easter and Passover.

Commissioner Bilsbarrow asked when the Historic Preservation Conference is.

Mr. Southard stated it is June 16-18, 2020.

Chair Buss stated that may cause a conflict. Other than that everyone is in agreement on the dates.

5) Charles T. Hayden House Update

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the board that the Hayden House is on schedule and phase two has taken place. There are prehistoric and historic features. Doors and Windows have been delivered from the Prism workshop. Some big and exciting news is that the courtyard is opened up again. There were delegates from the Sister Cities that came through and saw the progress and were overwhelmed by the age of the building.

6) Chair / Staff Updates

Chair Buss would like to have an update on adding a tribal member joining the commission.

Mr. Southard stated that there has not been any new consideration on the matter to this point.

Mr. Southard stated that there were updates on the street power monitoring. The monitoring plan is to 5th street and just south of 5th street there is a brick feature of the Western Foundation of the 1887 western freight house.

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that the street car has provided opportunity for signage of Tempe history in Black and White Photos.

7) Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items

Chair Buss would like to have an update on adding a tribal member joining the commission.

Mr. Southard stated that there has not been any new consideration on the matter to this point. He will have to speak with management on the subject more.

Chair Buss would like to see this a future agenda item to give more consideration.

There will be three events going on at Pueblo Grand this week. October 17, 2019 there is the 90th anniversary exhibit opening starting for the public at 7 the VIP starts at 6. Saturday October 19th is Moonlight over the mound fundraising dinner tickets are still available. Sunday October 20, 2019 is the opening of Phoenix Water Challenge.

Hearing adjourned at 7:22pm

Prepared by: Brittainy Nelson, Administrative Assistant
Reviewed by:

SA:bn
