

Minutes Tempe Aviation Commission February 11, 2020

Minutes of the Tempe Aviation Commission meeting held on February 11, 2020, 6:30 p.m., at the Engineering & Transportation Conference Room, Garden Level, City Hall Complex, 31 E. Fifth Street, Tempe, Arizona.

(MEMBERS) Present:

Lane Carraway
W. David Doiron
Valeriy Khaldarov
John Lynch
Stuart Mitnik
Trevor Pan
Ellen Poole

(MEMBERS) Absent:

Peter Schelstraete

Citizens Present:

Merrill Darcey
Shannon Dutton
Suvani Jashua
Kriste Melcher

City Staff Present:

Oddvar Tveit, *Environmental Quality Specialist, City of Tempe*

Agenda Item 1 – Call to Order

Mr. Lane Carraway called the meeting to order at 6:31 p.m.

Agenda Item 2 – Public Appearances

Mr. Darcey representing the Riverside Neighborhood Association talked about the problems the association has with PHX operations. Residents have made good use of the [PlaneNoise Inc.](#) Complaint box smart phone app that City of Phoenix has made available. When no response is received on smart phone complaints, residents turn to the FAA Noise Ombudsman with their complaints.

1. The Neighborhood Association is concerned about military jets at PHX and paths over Sun Devil Stadium, which seems to be based on how population densities were over twenty years ago. Because the populations have increased with multi-family housing along West 1st Street, more people are concerned about the military jets.
2. The Association is also concerned about the plans for expanding the airport. The Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport Comprehensive Asset Management Plan (CAMP) assumes the airport is a major regional hub airport instead of what it really is; one of the municipal airports in the valley that City of Phoenix is operating, which is located on a small geographic area inside metro Phoenix. It is not regional in the sense of being operated by an airport authority, which is common for most large hub airports. It currently has two terminals and two major airlines, one of which has economic problems, making future service by the American Airlines at PHX uncertain. The Neighborhood Association sees a future scenario where:
 - a. American Airlines eventually will be leaving PHX and consolidate at LAX.
 - b. DEN will be picking up a large share of flights in the southwest region of the US.
 - c. Southwest Airlines ends up dominating at PHX resulting in higher fares and more airlines establishing service at AZA (Phoenix-Mesa Gateway).

The Riverside Neighborhood Association needs the City of Tempe to show vigilance and not be persuaded by and accept projected needs for further development at Sky Harbor.

Agenda Item 3 – Consideration of Meeting Minutes (January 14, 2020)

Mr. Carraway asked for any changes or modifications and a motion to approve the drafted January 14, 2020 meeting minutes.

Motion: Mr. Lynch moved to approve the minutes as drafted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Doiron.

Action: The motion to approve the drafted January 14, 2020 meeting minutes passed by six votes. Ayes: Mr. Carraway, Mr. Doiron, Mr. Lynch, Mr. Mitnik, Mr. Pan, and Ms. Poole. Abstentions: None. Nays: Mr. Khaldarov. Absent: Mr. Schelstraete.

Agenda Item 4 – Aviation related information to new members

Mr. Doiron handed out information and talked about:

- Evolution of air traffic control; it is based on what has occurred in the past to maintain flight safety and can be viewed an agreement or cooperative arrangement between air traffic controllers and pilots rather than strict control from one party. The air traffic system relies on participants being compliant and agreeable. Enforcement means conducting a violation process that are serious and troublesome for both parties.
- Runway traffic patterns and left turns, pilots sit on the left in the cockpit and can easily see to the left when landing and they look straight out on departure. PHX used to have a diagonal runway before Terminal 3, so one might say the airport has an historic precedent for departing aircraft northeast towards Scottsdale.
- Noise abatement procedures used to be printed on airline Jeppesen charts for pilot information. Typically, airlines do not enforce pilot adherence to local noise abatement procedures.
- Arrival procedures traditionally guide pilots to the area of an airport. At some point before getting to the airport radar vectors from air traffic controllers are needed to be sequenced to reach the airport. In high traffic areas it is up to the controller's discretion to route you to where needed to get you safely to the airport.
- Some PHX departure charts have a fix showing at 4-DME and some do not. In general procedures can be deviated from under various circumstances. Typically, if pilots at night asks to be cleared to fly direct south to Tucson when reaching 6,000 feet, and the controller sees no air traffic reasons not to honor the request, clearance to follow a deviating heading will be given. The historic reason for the charted procedures was to minimize controller supervision and maintain aircraft separation.
- Climb profiles should not be tampered with in noise mitigation flight procedures because they include an element of risk. Even if the risk is small for having a technical failure when powering back on departure to reduce noise in places like the Orange County Airport, it can complicate matters for aircraft crews during a critical part of the flight.
- Most people in Tempe live under flight paths and like the convenience of having an airport close by, where it is cheap and easy access to an aircraft that bring you where you want to go.

Mr. Doiron answered question about how planes fly when they use on computer programmed RNAV waypoints to navigate, and about the need for smaller aircraft to have a transponder and VHF radio communication to be able to get through Tempe airspace.

Agenda Item 5 – Rules of Procedure Amendments

Mr. Tveit explained amendments to the rules of procedure to clarify what is expected under the Commission's rules of procedure. Proposed amendment in Section 1 of the rules if adopted will:

- Clarify that the need to be excused from not attending a scheduled commission meeting also include the member holding the office of Chair. The Chairperson will need to be excused by the Vice Chair when not available to participate at a scheduled meeting or a required training.
- Clarify that a request to be excused will need to be made to staff at the latest 24 hours before the scheduled meeting to enable the Chairperson and staff to determine whether a quorum of five can be present at the meeting in person or by calling into the meeting by phone.

Proposed amendment in Section 3 of the rules intends to help the public be accurately informed about what topics the Commission has listed for information, discussion and action, and if adopted will:

- Remind members to keep deliberations within the topics listed on the meeting agenda to avoid revisiting discussions of topics that were concluded at previous meetings.
- Remind the members to avoid a discussion of unrelated matters by deferring such matters to a future meeting agenda.

Discussion:

Mr. Carraway impressed upon the members not to engage in a discussion with members of the public who bring up issues under public appearances at the beginning of the Commission's meetings. Requests for clarification of statements made by the public under public appearance can be made.

Training for new boards and commission members is required.

Motion: Mr. Pan moved to approve the minutes as drafted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lynch.

Action: The motion to approve the resolution to make the proposed amendments made to the Commission's Rules of Procedure passed by six votes. Ayes: Mr. Carraway, Mr. Doiron, Mr. Lynch, Mr. Mitnik, Mr. Pan, and Ms. Poole. Abstentions: None. Nays: Mr. Khaldarov. Absent: Mr. Schelstraete.

Agenda Item 6 – Public Aviation Meeting/Workshop

Mr. Tveit addressed the wish expressed by the members to have another public aviation meeting hosted by the Commission in Tempe. The discussion included, the situation members faced last time the Commission arranged a public aviation meeting in Tempe, in that the City of Phoenix was the only represented stakeholder from the airport. The FAA being in the process of completing Step Two of the settlement agreement after a long legal process had an impact on the Commission's plan to get air traffic control expertise represented at the June 19, 2019 meeting. This is a factor the Commission still needs to acknowledge as the FAA consider its obligations made under the settlement agreement completed. The January 10, 2020 announcement about public comments resulting in no further plans for actions in PHX airspace has caused disappointment and upset residents in some communities that did not benefit from actions the FAA implemented under the settlement agreement in 2018. Tempe staff helped facilitating getting input from the public on the meeting topics by using "Tempe Forum" and a questionnaire. Additional ways to get public input from topics exists this year.

Discussions:

- The Commission needs to start preparations early to come up with a month and then a date so preparations for a public aviation meeting in Tempe can start.
- The meeting needs to be properly announced on city media outlets.
- The information published by the City on-line should be more easily explained to the public. It should explain in layman's terms what are the controllable factors, and not controllable such as weather impacts on traffic flow. If it can be easily addressed by the public through getting to a FAQ when they look up Tempe and aviation noise not only get to know what the Commission does, but also how aircraft operate would help educate the public, like include what are the national issues and these are controlled by the local airport.
- The published noise reports should be accompanied by a public guidance document.
- Getting airline representation to a commission meeting has been difficult to achieve.
- This is a public meeting to take place within the June to September 2020 time period.
- How about approaching the [Support Sky Harbor Coalition](#) to get the word out?

Motion: Mr. Tveit summarized a motion from Mr. Carraway and Mr. Lynch: (1) Each member e-mails staff with the months and dates the member is unavailable to participate at a public aviation meeting with the purpose of staff finding a month and date when most members are able to attend, and (2) the public input received at last year's

meeting to be distributed to the members with the purpose of the Commission coming up with issues to be addressed at a public meeting in a format that is understandable to the public. Mr. Mitnik seconded the motion.

Action: The motion to approve the resolution to make the proposed amendments made to the Commission's Rules of Procedure passed by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Mr. Carraway, Mr. Doiron, Mr. Khaldarov, Mr. Lynch, Mr. Mitnik, Mr. Pan, and Ms. Poole. Abstentions: None. Nays None. Absent: Mr. Schelstraete.

Agenda Item 7 – Tour of PHX Tower/TRACON

Mr. Tveit presented how to access and get through security at the PHX Tower/TRACON facility for the March 10, 2020 tour.

Agenda Item 8– Commissioners' business

- Public aviation meeting workshop in Tempe.

Mr. Khaldarov asked to be updated on the City of Phoenix follow up analyzing why complaints peak from resident to the City of Phoenix. Staff will ask the City of Phoenix about investigations of high complainants.

Agenda Item 9– Schedule next TAVCO meeting

The next meeting was scheduled for April 14, 2020.

Agenda Item 10 – Adjournment

Motion: Mr. Doiron moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Mitnik seconded the motion.

Action: The meeting was adjourned at 7:56 p.m. by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Mr. Carraway, Mr. Doiron, Mr. Khaldarov, Mr. Lynch, Mr. Mitnik, Mr. Pan, and Ms. Poole. Abstentions: None. Nays None. Absent: Mr. Schelstraete.

Prepared by: Oddvar Tveit

Reviewed by: Christina Hoppes