



Minutes City of Tempe Sustainability Commission December 16, 2019

Minutes of the Tempe Sustainability Commission meeting held on Monday, November 18, 2019, 4:30 p.m., at the Engineering & Transportation Conference Room, City Hall, 31 E. 5th Street, Tempe, Arizona.

(MEMBERS) Present:

Kendon Jung (Chair)
Ryan Mores (Vice Chair)
Katja Brundiers
John Kane

Serita Sulzman
Steven Russell
Sukki Jahnke
Gretchen Reinhardt

(MEMBERS) Absent:

Barbie Burke
Stephanie Milam-Edwards

City Staff Present:

Braden Kay, Sustainability Director
Grace DelMonte Kelly, Energy Management Coordinator
Ryan Levesque, Deputy Community Development Director
Shauna Warner, Neighborhood Program Manager
Robbie Aaron, Planner II
Chad Weaver, Community Development Director
Bonnie Richardson, Principal Planner
Samantha Zah, Office of Sustainability
Josh Pike, Intern
Will Taft, Intern

Guests Present:

David Sokolowski, resident
Nancy Buell, resident

Chair Jung called the meeting to order at 4:32 p.m.

Agenda Item 1 – Public Appearance

Chair Jung asked the guests to introduce themselves. Resident David Sokolowski said he had some recommendations for the Sustainability Density Bonus agenda item. He recommended adding bus stops/shelters, urban forestry funding and direct funds to front-line communities to the Sustainability Density Bonus program.

Escalante Community Garden representative Nancy Buell said the TCAA does good work to feed people and are not focused on gardening. Nancy suggested a different organization or agency, such as the Parks Department, work with the community garden staff to support and maintain the garden.

Agenda Item 2 – Approval of Meeting Minutes

Chair Jung introduced the minutes of the November 18, 2019 meeting. Vice Chair Mores made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Jahnke seconded.

Motion: Vice Chair Mores

Second: Commissioner Jahnke

Decision: Approved 8-0

Voted to Approve:

Kendon Jung (Chair)
Ryan Mores (Vice Chair)
Katja Brundiars
John Kane
Serita Sulzman
Steven Russell
Sukki Jahnke
Gretchen Reinhardt

Agenda Item 3 – Sustainability Density Bonus

Community Development Director Chad Weaver said they have been presenting this proposal to the stakeholders. He said they had been working on outreach for the Urban Core Masterplan these are the four elements they expect to see from it:

- Sustainability
- Affordable Housing
- Public amenities/ public open space
- Historic Preservation

Chad said the concept is that these elements are not starting anything. Tempe has been building an urban area with tall buildings and more density – that growth will continue whether we pass this or not.

Chad said they need to accommodate a lot of folks. They can either hope that some of the goals they hope to achieve will get done or they can put this into place to ensure something is done. To get more density, the developer would have to give back something for one of the four elements.

Deputy Community Development Director Ryan Levesque said that there are:

- Bonus Elements
- Bonus Program Structure
- Bonus points

Ryan said that in the new Urban Core Masterplan, we've developed a program where the zoning code is an opt-in process. There is a voluntary Density Bonus program that would allow for greater density and height to get the elements we want to get for Tempe.

We asked how can we yield additional community benefits? The difference between what developers are allowed and what additional density they can get is to get the community benefits back on site.

- Affordable or workforce housing
- Public outdoor gathering space
- Sustainability, including rain water harvesting, solar panels, shade elements
- Bonus elements off site: if a developer is building a commercial building, they can pay an in-lieu fee that goes into an affordable housing trust for affordable housing

They want to see some sites preserved, so they asked how can we preserve a building? They can transfer development rights from one property to another property through an overlay district. The receiving property gets additional height or density.

The bonus program structure provides a voluntary path to achieve additional development rights beyond Urban Core base by acquiring bonus points.

Urban Core Development Base and Bonus Potential:

Urban Code District	UCD Base	UCD Bonus - Tier 1 <i>requires 60 points</i>	UCD Bonus - Tier 2 <i>requires 100 points</i>
UC-1	125 ft 65+ du/acre	140 ft 65+ du/acre	160 ft 65+ du/acre
UC-2	90 ft 65+ du/acre	110 ft 65+ du/acre	130 ft 65+ du/acre
UC-3	90 ft up to 65 du/acre	110 ft up to 65 du/acre	130 ft 65+ du/acre
UC-4	70 ft up to 45 du/acre	n/a	90 ft up to 65 du/acre
UC-5	55 ft up to 25 du/acre	n/a	60 ft up to 25 du/acre
UC-6	40 ft up to 20 du/acre	n/a	45 ft up to 20 du/acre

The more bonus points a developer gets, the more density and height they can get. Ryan said they calculated the value of what they are getting for onsite programs. They can be added to the site.

They are looking for sustainability elements such as:

- Comprehensive shade
- Roof materials
- Solar gain
- Shade for west-facing windows
- Permeable paving for resilience to heat

Greenhouse gas reduction:

- 80% of parking spaces to be EV ready
- Solar panels over 20% of site
- Space for future installation of renewable energy
- Comply for IGCC 2018
- Energy savings of 50% of baseline energy consumption
- Provide for on site grid investment for critical uses

Sustainability Director Braden Kay said this is one of the first pieces of policy that follows the climate action plan. They did a lot of listening and a lot of thinking about what makes sense.

Commissioners commented and asked:

- I think it's a great place to start. Urban forestry could be a key way to incorporate more trees.
- Why limit height / density in core? Don't you want density in core? Ryan said there are groups who don't want to see density. They have done a comprehensive land use analysis and how they integrate the base, where can they find a threshold. Chad said we have heard the opposite sentiment. Ryan said they are taking input from everyone; the majority support the density bonus so far. They want to make sure people will use this.
- What is the rate of adoption of tiers? To what extent will they be implemented? Is it a one-time fee? Ryan Said yes. Chad said they have no idea what the adoption rate will be, they are waiting to hear from the development community. They are working with Transportation on the 20-minute city, traffic and congestion and working to further other modes of transportation. The goal is to get the tools in place and then give this to the developer and council of what we want to see on site. We have street tree requirements, and it's getting harder because of utilities and overhead/underground lines.

Chair Jung thanked Chad and Ryan and asked commissioners to send additional questions to staff.

Agenda Item 4 – Climate Action Plan Update 2021 Engagement

Sustainability Director Braden Kay said he worked with ASU on outreach for the climate action plan. A lot of the outreach was shaped by ASU. The target date is January to begin engagement on Climate Action Plan 2021.

Neighborhood Program Manager Shauna Warner said tonight we'd like to start a conversation on what your vision is, on what you'd like to see.

Braden said when we talk about public engagement for the 2021 update, we have heard it should have a more sophisticated, more specific plan for public participation. What are the goals, types of engagement? We'd like to take that info and come up with a plan to determine where we can get resources with minimal amount of funding and we need to find inside and outside resources.

Shauna said the biggest challenge was when a resident asked can you explain this? It's also apart of the hope for the next version, what can I do to make a difference? Make it more relatable. Braden said we heard form residents that this is a very business-oriented plan. Shauna said we'll have equity in the next plan.

Commissioners commented and asked:

- To what extent should the Neighborhood Advisory Commission and Human Relations Commission be involved in this? Who should we be reaching out to? Shauna said our Neighborhood Advisory Commission and Human Relations Commission are partners with you in equity and innovation and they will be interested in working with you next year.

- How can we involve schools? Shauna said we are in the schools for park improvements, the kids come in with have activities we can work with them.
- Some stakeholders could include: Youth Advisory Commission, Tempe Chamber of Commerce and DTA.
- This spring we are going to have a business forum, we want to make sure businesses understand the climate action plan.
- How can we organize the 2021 plan through the lens of our engagement groups? What are the high priorities for youth? Shaun said some of it we can plan for ahead of time. There may be a way to geo-code. Parks and Rec had feedback with 1800 responses, we looked at it and it may lead to changes in the program.
- Geo-coding is critical. In faith communities have you been talking with Tempe Interfaith Fellowship? Have you been using our rec centers to engage people and youth? Shauna said we find our residents are using rec centers Escalante, west side and north Tempe multi gen center. With the equity action piece, it's not a one size fits all. A lot of the outreach we are doing we have GIS maps and we have more ideas from this.
- Climate action plan could be a case critical panel. We could help with events or research. Shauna said our challenge is we can't limit our outreach to meetings and online input, we need to meet in person.
- Braden said we are going too to have a coordinated effort to work on city/university partnerships.
- Shauna said we usually connect with students in leadership positions.

Agenda Item 5 – Sustainability Awards

Shauna Warner said April 4th is the neighborhood awards event. The more people you get there, the better it is. The sustainability awards nomination form is on the neighborhood events website.

The February meeting is when you will make the selection. The link to the website was emailed to you. Braden thanked Shauna for her help with the three events.

Agenda Item 6 – Transit Bus Shelter Designs

Principal Planner Bonnie Richardson said she is here to talk about the new design for the bus shelters. This project is exciting because we're focusing on how to make sustainable bus shelters. We asked different commissions to come to the steering committee. We felt this was important in developing the best solutions. We are asking what makes a good transit shelter? There are a lot of criteria, staff wants it to be easy to fabricate/ maintain and to be functional/attractive. We are trying to reduce heat element. Two issues the commission asked for is to maximize shade and add more seating.

- Tylin, J2 and Lee Engineering are working on it. We had them develop 9 concept sketches
- Our committee reviewed them
- There are a lot of places we only have 2 feet of right-of-way
- They will do a time of day and shade analysis and come up with preferred concept to city council
- Once we have standard details, we will fabricate a prototype then will install
- Important equity issues
- By collecting data, we need to know where the right of way line is; some land is private
- We want to put shade in at all stops
- There are 806 bus stops; 308 have shelters
- We have a dedicated transit tax to pay for shelters

We asked what makes a Tempe shelter iconic? We talked about what materials shape that? Its difficult to get shade on a limited budget. We are looking for inspiration, what kind of materials to use, looked at a lot of elements from Europe.

In Darin Petrucci's office, the screens are printed from polymer-plastic, the bus driver needs to see rider and the rider needs to see out for safety.

There are two more public meetings, one on January 21st and one on January 28th. Let us know if you have any suggestions or recommendations.

Commissioners commented and asked:

- Have you talked with Engineering Material's and sciences department at ASU? Bonnie said yes, we're still working with them. We are finding there are competing interests; an 8' x 8' concrete pad is required to accommodate wheelchair access, it makes it hotter, and we are trying to cool the area, so we are working with private owners to add trees, and it requires irrigation to keep the tree alive.
- Can you use stormwater for watering? Is there a timeline to cover the shelters? Bonnie said not yet, we don't know the number of bus shelters we will be doing each year. We don't have a scale or cost yet.
- Have you considered sponsorship? There was discussion about Valley metro assets which have ads versus Tempe assets, such as orbit buses and bus stops which do not have ads because of local policy.
- These are amenities that are going to be here for a while. Initially, light rail stations had a neutral color and over the next 20 years, you can plug in different materials, colors. Bonnie said we are moving this project forward and we don't know who will take it through the next steps. What are the maintenance costs, how to design it so it's easy to do and we also want to mix it up.

Chair Jung thanked Bonnie and said if commissioners have any further questions or comments to send them to staff.

Agenda Item 7 – Annual Report

Sustainability Director Braden Kay said each year we do an annual report on what we've done, and what we plan to do. You could vote to approve it now or vote to approve it pending edits. You could provide edits to the Chair over the next few days. We need to submit the report this week.

Commissioner Kane made a motion to approve the annual report with edits as approved by the Chair. Commissioner Reinhardt seconded.

Motion: Commissioner Kane

Second: Commissioner Reinhardt

Decision: Approved 8-0

Voted to Approve:

Kendon Jung (Chair)
Ryan Mores (Vice Chair)
Katja Brundiers
John Kane
Serita Sulzman
Steven Russell
Sukki Jahnke
Gretchen Reinhardt

Motion was approved 8-0.

Agenda Item 8 – Climate Action Plan Highlight Actions Check-in

Braden said before report-out, two interns Josh Pike and Will Taft will present about work they have done on Resilience to Extreme Heat and a roadmap for Resilient Energy Hubs.

The interns gave presentations. Braden said that the Commission will receive copies of these presentations in the next week.

Agenda Item 9 – Housekeeping Items

There were no items.

Agenda Item 10 – Future Agenda Items

Future agenda items include the following:

- Awards on next agenda
- Bus shelters
- Water department talk about the Nature Conservancy

A motion was made to adjourn.

All approved 8 – 0

Motion: Vice Chair Mores

Second: Commissioner Sulzman

Decision: Approved 8-0

Voted to Approve:

Kendon Jung (Chair)
Ryan Mores (Vice Chair)
Katja Brundiers
John Kane
Serita Sulzman
Steven Russell
Sukki Jahnke
Gretchen Reinhardt

The meeting was adjourned at 6:42 pm.

Prepared by: Grace DelMonte Kelly

Reviewed by: Braden Kay