

# MINUTES

## HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

### OCTOBER 14, 2020

Minutes of the regular hearing of the Historic Preservation commission, of the City of Tempe, which was held via Cisco WebEx.

#### Regular Meeting 6:00 PM

<b>Present:</b>	<b>Staff:</b>
Chuck Buss, Chair	Brenda Abney, Museum Mgr
Martin Ball, Vice-Chair	Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner
Chris Garraty	Brittainy Nelson, Administrative Assistant
Jim Garrison	Alex Smith, Dep Com Dev Dir – Special Projects
Gregory Larson	
Laurene Montero	John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer
Joe Nucci	

#### 1) Voting of the Meeting Minutes

**Motion by Vice Chair Ball** to approve the Meeting Minutes of September 9, 2020; second by **Commissioner Montero**. Motion passed on **6-0** vote.

**Ayes:** Martin Ball, Chris Garraty, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, Joe Nucci

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** Chuck Buss

**Absent:** Matthew Bilsbarrow, Elizabeth Gilbert

#### 2) Tempe Depot Preservation Presentation and Discussion

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that this project has come before them previously. The Tempe Depot is not listed in the Tempe Historic Property Register. Although eligible for designation, the building has never been nominated by the property owner. Mid-1980s additions to the Tempe Depot made in association with the Depot Cantina restaurant still stand. However, it research of aerial photos other forms of documentation, when paired with in-person observations of the property, reveals that the additions, although significant in size, are rather easily reversible. Once reversed, it appears that there will be a great deal of integrity. Upon the removal of the additions, it is likely that the Tempe Depot would appear as it did upon its completion in 1924. Because the property is not listed in the Tempe Historic Property Register, the HPC has no formal purview. Barry Shannahan and his colleagues at RED Development have been terrific partners who have been in discussions with City staff to understand the significance of the Tempe Depot and the surrounding property. Mr. Shannahan has crafted a proposal that has been viewed at a prior HPC meeting and will be rehashed during the current meeting.

Mr. Smith stated that staff is actively negotiating a development agreement with RED and Mr. Shannahan. One of the key provisions is the preservation and rehabilitation of the Tempe Depot. The developer is currently pursuing entitlements; with the case will soon be heard by the DRC and City Council.

Presentation from Applicant: Ms. Manjula Vaz

Ms. Vaz informed the Commissioners that Mr. Shannahan has been working with Mr. Smith and Mr. Southard for about a year now. The applicant is E&R Holdings with is a partner with RED Development. RED does a lot of mixed-use projects such as offices, hotels, and multifamily. They have developed over 200 million square feet in 11 states. They have completed the CityScape project in downtown Phoenix that has the ice-skating rink along Central in the winter. The developer has also done Block 23 where there is the Fry's and the multifamily adjacent to the Fry's across from the Phoenix Suns arena. There is also the 44<sup>th</sup> and Camelback with the Sam Fox hotel with the Mercury and Suns practice arena. SmithGroup is the architect on the project, and they have done a lot of things though out the Valley and many historic preservation projects. The property is a hard shape. There are two properties bisected by light rail and the Depot is on the western edge and in the middle of the site. There are considerations regarding how to preserve the Depot in the location and for future use. The new commercial development consists of preservation and rehabilitation of the 1924 Tempe Depot building. The development will include a 17-story office tower with 319,410 square feet of office space And an 18-story hotel tower with 280 guest rooms and 9,415 sf of hotel meeting space. There will also be 23,970 square feet of indoor retail/restaurant/bar space, 4,600 square feet of outdoor dining patio space, 22,650 square feet of public gathering plaza space at the street level, a shared hotel amenity deck with a pool, and a 7 level parking structure providing 1,118 vehicle spaces and 11 motorcycle spaces.

Ms. Vaz informed the Commissioners that they are going to the DRC and City Council. They are seeking approval for a Planned Area Development Overlay to establish site specific development standards and a Use Permit to allow tandem parking in the City Center zoning district. There needs to be an administrative finding that the project design generally conforms to the intent of the Transportation Overlay District. There are some TOD issues with the light rail, Streetcar, the construction on Ash. within addition, there are some utility conflicts along Ash. There have been talks about what the Depot wants to be with City Staff. There is also the possibility that the Depot will serve as a stop on a future commuter rail line.

Mr. Shannahan informed the Commissioners that the team has taken the advisement of the Commissioners and gave more space for the Depot. The building that was originally located in front of the Depot is being located closer to the street. Which gives more plaza area around the depot and at the request of the commissioners they took a deeper look at level 2 of the parking structure in trying to make more room. The team has been able to fuse together the 2<sup>nd</sup> structure of the parking structure to the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor. Then on the north side of the depot there are a couple of columns removed and a big open area. In that admitted area there will be a gate way so that when the commuter rail returns then one can come off the train and onto the platform through the gated area into the plaza and then to a pedestrian link to Ash, Mill, and 3<sup>rd</sup> Street. Where there is a link to the light rail on 3<sup>rd</sup> or the Streetcar system immediately in front of the hotel lobby, or a bus transit lot inside of the office area. The goal is to not visually distract from the Depot.

Mr. Smith informed the Commissioners that Mr. Shannahan has been working with Valley Metro to be able to build over the tracks. There are some complications with the guideway and FTA involved. Then the Bureau of Reclamation and the Water Users Association because there is a line to the south of Depot. Often times a company is more considered with the pro formas but Mr. Shannahan has demonstrated a technical aptitude. This will give a result of what the City and Commissioners are wanting with the Depot.

Commission Discussion

Chairman Buss asked when will the rendering be available because the current rendering makes the Depot look consumed by the building and does it differ from what the Commissioners saw at the previous meeting.

Mr. Shannahan stated the difference is the elimination of the first level of parking. Where it would have continued across the top of the Depot to connect with the other side of the parking structure and there would be three columns that come down across the face of the front side to the Depot.

Mr. Smith also added that there is not much that can be done about the western mass of the building other than remove the flooring like Mr. Shannahan did. When a person is on the plaza level and you can see daylight between that building and the Depot. This will be the main pedestrian access with the western façade there is already a five-story office building going through entitlement process. Once the five-story office is complete and with the parking structure there is not going to be a view from the West; it will be from the east to the west. Also, the City will have a pedestrian ingress / egress easement for the plaza.

Vice Chair Ball informed everyone that he previously pointed out the second floor of the parking structure in comparison to the height of the roof of the Depot. Having had some experience and working on projects of this scale and historical structures as well; it is not lost to him how big an ask the Commission has made in terms of the parking lost and the structural reality. Therefore, he appreciates the effort that the team has made. It is the only place in Tempe that he can think of where Light rail, City bus, Streetcar, and walkable downtown urban core and the potential of regional train. The area is looking for a large and diverse program. The thing that comes to mind right way is the massive train station in Kyoto that is over many city blocks. It knits together many different functions; hotel, retail, lifestyle, and transportation. The key to that is the urban space that is at the base. That is accessible and easily navigated from one transportation mode to another. He is very interested in seeing the façade and how it is treated as well as the character of the area.

Chris Ledwith from Mr. Shannahan team informed the commissioners that they do have the rendering that is a step above but not the final project. Mr. Shannahan stated he would like to wait till the corrections were done before they view it. Mr. Shannahan will forward to the commissioners in a day or two once the information was fixed.

Ms. Vaz did show the Commissioners the western elevation and took them through how the structure will look. Ms. Vaz informed the commissioners that they are taking the information to DRC October 27, 2020 and then to City Council in early December.

Chair Buss called for a motion:

**Motion by Vice Chair Ball** to support the project contingent upon delivery of the west façade with the letter of support to follow later; second by **Commissioner Larson**. Motion passed on **6-0** vote.

**Ayes:** Martin Ball, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Joe Nucci, Chair Buss, Chris Garraty

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** Matthew Bilsbarrow, Elizabeth Gilbert, Laurene Montero

-----

3) Approval of 2020 HPC Annual Report

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that the Annual Report was included in the Packet that they received from City Staff. This is requested from the City Council for the past 3 to 4 years to be kept updated on the various Boards and Commissions. Reflecting what the goals are, what progress has been made, and if they are in need of assistance. Included in the report City Staff talks about the Hayden House, HP plan that is being prepared along with the survey, blanket monitoring and treatment plan, along with some goals.

Commission Discussion

Vice Chair Ball stated that he has been thorough the statement and

Chair Buss asked how far along is the survey.

Mr. Southard stated that with both survey and inventory, blanket plan research is very critical for both and several archives that have not been accessible has altered the schedule. Both plans due to the need to have some public involvement and the ethnographic work with members of various tribes have been delayed due to Covid.

Mr. Smith informed the commissioners that Mr. Southard and him have had discussion rather the continue with virtual public meetings. He would rather have them in person but will give a more formal update to the commission and return in November.

Commissioner Larson questioned the attendance record and that there were only 3 meetings being report.

Mr. Smith stated that they have only meet 3 times he was shocked to find out this information as well. He did confirm the information with Ms. Nelson the Administrative Assistance for HPC.

Chair Buss stated that seems correct to him since there have not been a lot of action items and with Covid the Commission did not meet much.

Commissioner Nucci wanted to congratulate Mr. Southard and Mr. Smith on a nice report. The Report makes it clear to Mayor and Council how many projects are going on and what is being accomplished during the difficult months. He would like to get the HPC in front of the Council and put a face to the group and show how important preservation in the Council priority.

Chair Buss called for a motion:

**Motion by Vice Chair Ball** to accept the report as submit for the 2020 annual report to council; second by **Commissioner Larson**. Motion passed on **6-0** vote.

**Ayes:** Martin Ball, Chris Garraty, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Joe Nucci, Chair Buss

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** Matthew Bilsbarrow, Elizabeth Gilbert, Laurence Montero

-----

#### 4) Tempe Butte Graffiti Mitigation update

##### Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that there was graffiti painted at the top of Tempe Butte as well as Papago Park. The City has contracted with Logan Simpson to remediate the issue using the method that was developed by the City of Phoenix. That is using Elephant Snot that is a product that does not damage and can be washed off with water. This method is quite effective. Logan Simpson sent a crew to the top of the Butte and Papago Park about two weeks ago. They had a great deal of success in removal however there are a couple of areas that were not identified to the Logan Simpson crew. So, they were not in the scope but overall successful. Salt River Indian team sent out their media crew to film it. The goal is put together a PSA about the Butte. The City of Tempe channel 11 crew came out as well as the Arizona Republic sent out a photographer and interviewed a few people on site about the graffiti and remediation. Unfortunately, after several days there are new graffiti that has been applied. This is a on going issue that needs to be addressed. Beyond the removal protocol there is a need for a discussion of deterrent and enforcement. Logan Simpson staff also found someone that was living a top the Butte when they went to assess the graffiti.

##### Commission Discussion

Commissioner Garraty stated that the graffiti that is hard to reach near the ledge doesn't want to put any of the crew at risk. They are looking for ways or people to help reach the area.

Commissioner Larson asked if there is any electricity left in the Towers.

Mr. Southard stated that there is some power at the top of the Butte in fact there is a very healthy supply up there.

Mr. Smith stated that there used to be power running all the way to the communication towers. However, the conduits have been capped and then lower down on the Butte there is a power box. The engineers were told to leave power there with a 60-amp twist lock circuit.

Mr. Southard stated that he was informed Mr. Simpson and Commissioner Garraty that getting the water that is required up to the top is also a challenge.

Vice Chair Ball asked if the position of the graffiti is such that a spider crane would be of an assistance. However, not sure with the slope.

Mr. Southard stated that is a good question he is however not all familiar with a spider crane. Is it something that can get near the top.

Vice Chair Ball stated that they are portable he is just not sure how high up. He would have to hike up and see it. His company has used them on the interior of buildings they don't have an extreme reach. However, if one is to hike up the existing problem then one might be able to have access that way.

Mr. Southard informed him that is something to look at the area in question is to the top to the northwest of the peak just below the top.

Vice chair Ball also stated they could use donkeys to the water to the top. People use them for thousands of years.

Chairman Buss suggested they use a firehose.

Mr. Southard stated that there was some discussion on that looking at where the nearest spiket might be. There may be one near the area of the water tanks.

Chairman Buss asked what is the length of time that the elephant snot would need to sit. Can it be for hours or a day or two? This way they can time the application to an approaching storm.

Commissioner Larson asked is there a way to get some cameras to capture who is doing the graffiti. Or a motion active light would be a deterrent.

Mr. Southard informed the commissioners that is something that City Staff have investigated. Things such as motion active lighting, thermal cameras. But also, what should be the penalty once someone is caught? In an ideal world the four tribes would be involved in how to deter, how penalties will be enforced and what the protocol is for documenting and removal of graffiti. The individuals doing the graffiti are using paints that are more difficult to remove such as automotive paints. Elephant snot is a great product based on the age of the paint how many layers and the pigment.

Chair Buss suggested that there are signs on the trail leading up that there is enforcement and something saying that they may be watched.

Commissioner Larson asked if City staff has reached out to Tempe PD.

Mr. Southard stated that Greg Hayden with parks has identified two officers that are assigned to parks rather it be paperwork or dispatched there when there is a call. However, this tend to happen in the late-night hours, and they are not able to identify who is doing it.

Vice Chair Ball stated that they should consider maybe using drones to patrol the area every now and then. However unaware of the air space rights.

Mr. Southard stated that they have been using them at the flower mill. In regard to the air space issue there is a way to do it.

Commissioner Montero asked if they were aware of Rob Vegas from BLM he does investigation on archaeology crimes and reached out to consider installing cameras. She would be happy to pass on his information to City Staff and see if he can help in this matter.

Mr. Southard stated that would be greatly apricated and everything is on the table.

Chairman Buss suggested putting a camera on the PD building since it is City property no one permission would be needed and then someone would be able to watch the mountain with thermal lights at night.

-----

#### 5) Hayden House Presentation

##### Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that the Hayden House project is complete. As promised, he has some information to share with the progress that had been done. The oldest extant portions starting form the room at the Northeast corner were constructed in 1873. The Mill Avenue wing was an 1870's wing, the Rio Salado wing was an 1880's wing. The building did have constant evolution over the first fifty years of being built. It was a home, a store and at some point, in the late 1880's to early 1890's it became a Hotel. Later became a boarding house. There was a second addition that was added as a boarding house that runs East to West of what is now the Rio Salado wing. By 1951 the home is nearly 50 years old and there was article that stated there was some improvements completed in 1921 and even then, citizens were lamenting that there was some history lost. It was the 1924 that Robert Evans did restoration work in the state that the building was already 50 years old. There is an older site plan of when the home was used as a boarding house in the 1920's or so. In 1924 Robert Evans an architect the restoration of the Hayden House was his first project. He later went on to design the Eisenhower Draft house, the Old Mission Church in Scottsdale, and another of other adobe buildings. The restoration was not strictly bond to what is now known as the Secretarial of Interior Standards. There were some contextual elements added. Spanish colonial revival was very big at the time. Mr. Evans felt that this home was one that should have been in some portions. That building was served as a restaurant from 1924 to 2014. The Monti's family bought the property back in 1954 and opened Monti's in 1956. The property was listed in the Tempe Historic Property Register and National Register of Historic Places. The restaurant closed on November 17, 2014. Restoration of the property did not start right away there were some issues that the commissioners had to deal with and other factors. The Property did sit vacant for an extended period. In 2018 it made the front page of Tempe – Ahwatukee Republic with the headline of Vacant and Vulnerable. Shortly after that the property came to the commission and it was decided that rehabilitation work would need to be completed at the Hayden House prior being allowed to commence with other portions of the other projects such as the 100 Mill. 100 Mill being an office and hotel building. Reggie McKay was brought on by the then owner of the project in July of 2018. The work took a little more then two years the official Certificate of Occupancy was issued September 4, 2020. Mr. Southard then showed the Commissioners photos of what the past house looked like and how the home looked once the work was completed.

##### Commission Discussion

Vice Chair Ball asked if the paint color derived from itself that was on the door to the office for Kate at Hayden house.

Mr. Southard informed him that it was a color that is associated with the door it was not planned but did occur.

-----

6) Chair / Staff Updates

Mr. Southard informed the commissioners that there have been emails about the Urban Maser Core team that the plan has been tabled because of a lack of community census.

Work to be done the Gonzales Martinez House soon. There funds available and have been. Looking to undertake stability work to make sure that the house is capable of being rehabilitated when a larger scale of the property occurs in the future.

In receipt of the report for the Eisenhower house that is being reviewed now. There is a test of the history plaster, overall building assessment, looking at doors and windows. There is going to be some work that is needed to be done on the home that will come to the commission.

Next meeting hoping to have the Hayden Butte sign. The Indian Gila River Community have received funding to create signage for the various landforms. The sign will be placed at the Southeast corner of Mill Avenue and Rio Salado Parkway.

Hearing adjourned at 7:57pm

-----

Prepared by: Brittainy Nelson, Administrative Assistant  
Reviewed by:



---

Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner

SA:bn