

# MINUTES

## HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

### FEBRUARY 10, 2021

Minutes of the regular hearing of the Historic Preservation commission, of the City of Tempe, which was held virtually.

#### Regular Meeting 6:06 PM

<b>Present:</b>	<b>Staff:</b>
Chuck Buss, Chair	Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner
Martin Ball, Vice-Chair	Craig Hayton, Dept Com Svcs Dir – Parks & Rec
Chris Garraty	Erin Kirkpatrick
Jim Garrison	Brittainy Nelson, Administrative Assistant
Gregory Larson	Alex Smith, Deputy Dir. Special Projects
Laurence Montero	Jared Smith, Senior Curator
Joe Nucci	John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

#### 1) Voting of the Meeting Minutes

**Motion** by **Vice Chair Ball** to approve the Meeting Minutes of January 13, 2021; second by **Commissioner Garrison**. Motion passed on **7-0** vote.

**Ayes:** Chuck Buss, Martin Ball, Chris Garraty, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurence Montero, Joe Nucci

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** Elizabeth Gilbert ,Matthew Bilsbarrow

#### 2) Discuss and consider Four Southern Tribes representation on Historic Preservation Commission

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that in 2019 there was discussion of including a representative of the Four Southern Tribes. Ensuring representation on the Historic Preservation Commission this would have to occur via an Ordinance revision. In 2019 the Commission by consensus recommended that the action be taken. It is before the commission to take formal action.

#### Commission Discussion

Vice Chair Ball asked clarification of July 10, 2019 on page 2 of the meeting minutes the Commission was in discussion on rather this would be an advisory position or not. In that he is aware that the Commission will need to make a change in the ordinance to present to the Council. The question is rather this is a change to the Ordinance because of the potential for the candidate to not be residents of Tempe or is it required simply as a

new member of the Commission in advisory position or in Voting position. If the Commission wishes to have a voting position, there will have to be a change of Ordinance would the same be true if it were an advisory position.

Mr. Southard answered that the Ordinance change would be required for a few reasons. First being that all members of the Historic Preservation Commission need to be Tempe Residents. Then there are specifications as to representation of professions. The Four Southern Tribes' member will need to be included in the group to best assure representation. Matter of Advisory versus voting member would be up to Council. The advisory position of the Tempe Historical Museum is in the Ordinance. The discussion with the Four Southern Tribes has shown interest in the representation being a voting member.

Vice Chair Ball asked has there been further discussion with the Four Southern Tribes about how many members would be requested. If there was one member added, then the Commission would be placed at an even number or when the Commission routes out would they remain at 9.

Mr. Smith answered that there has been discussion on that, and he believes it would be the later. It would go into effect immediately and it would go into effect at 10 for a while. Then when the next member termed out. The position would not be filled.

Chair Buss asked when the next member of the Commissioners term out.

Ms. Nelson informed the Commissioners that it would be Chair Buss in 2021.

Chair Buss stated that he thought it was 2022.

Ms. Nelson stated that she will contact the City Clerk Office and find out the correct date.

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that Chair Buss does have till 2022.

Commissioner Montero stated when the Commissioners talked about the subject a while back. The Commissioners agreed that this was a great thing to do.

Chair Buss called for a motion:

Motion by **Commissioner Montero** to that the Historic Preservation Commission direct the Historic Preservation Office to transmit to City Council a recommendation that the Historic Preservation Ordinance be revised to include a reserved seat for a representative of the Four Southern Tribes; second by **Commissioner Nucci**. Motion passed on **7-0** vote.

**Ayes:** Chuck Buss, Martin Ball, Chris Garraty, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurence Montero, Joe Nucci

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** Elizabeth Gilbert ,Matthew Bilsbarrow

Mr. Southard asked for clarification if the seat would ensure that there is a Four Southern Tribes, but would the representative will be selected by the Four Southern Tribes.

Chair Buss stated that all members of the Commission are above by the City of Tempe.

Mr. Southard stated that there would need to be a representative that would be designated with the advice and consent of Mayor and Council to be appointed to the Commission. If there could be a supplemental motion to clarify if it the wish of the Historic Preservation Commission that the Four Southern Tribes would identify a candidate who would then be considered by the Mayor and Council for appointment that would streamline the process and avoid questions that may arise.

Motion by **Vice Chair Ball** to have the Four Southern Tribes put forth a candidate for the major to approve: second by **Commissioner Nucci**. Motion passed on **7-0** vote.

**Ayes:** Chuck Buss, Martin Ball, Chris Garraty, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurence Montero, Joe Nucci

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** Elizabeth Gilbert ,Matthew Bilsbarrow

-----

3) Streetcar signage for Oidbad Do'ag / Tempe Butte

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that there have been several discussions with several of the representative of the Tempe History Museum and the streetcar team regarding signage that is to be erected at various streetcar stops. The initial plan was to have signs at each location to include photographs from various points and explanations of what is at the stops. There was discussion on part of the commission that the signs spoke to history dating 1871 to the present. Excluded Tempe very rich prehistory in working with the streetcar team, history museum and other City staff was able to obtain one of the locations that had been slated for Tempe History Sign for use by the Four Southern Tribe that location being the Southeast corner of Mill Avenue and Rio Salado Parkway which is right at the base of the Butte. Funding had been made available to the Indian Gila River Community and they had Employee Dr. Andy Darling of Southwest Heritage Research to draft a serious of signs for the various landforms throughout the Valley. Provided the Commissioners with a draft version of the sign.

Presentation from: Dr. Andrew Darling

Dr. Darling informed the commissioners that the signs are an effort from the South Mountain Freeway Traditional Culture Properties study. In communication with the Gila River Indian Community expressed an interest in trying to do something that was useful in increasing awareness publicly. There are very deep prehistoric Native American roots of the region. This will give the opportunity to identifying places that people can go and see. One of the things that archaeologist have to deal with is that people find out about places and they would like to go and see them but they may not be public parks or public facilities and could lead to damage of sites that are not publicly accessible. The team has come up with an ideal to create a series of signs that would identify topographic features, or sensitive areas.

One of the first signs was the Iron Mountains. This area is becoming the initial prototype sign and the sign would have some aspect of the place that it was describing. It would be placed in the homeland. While the Homeland is much bigger than the Metropolitan area. There focus is on the Metropolitan area is where they would like to have the signs. Each Map would include a master map that would have the traditional names for places and a few features that would be recognizable to people so that they can figure out where they are and places that are identified accessible to the public. They are looking to add signs to South Mountain Park and Preserve. Working with the Municipalities that want to have signs. ADOT is willing to fund the community to do some development of the designs. Another aspect of the outreach project is that the work is being produced through the Gila River Indian Community. Before it goes out to others to look at it has been vetted through the Tribal Preservation office to find out what elements of the sign that they would want to see in the sign. In the case of Oidbad Do'ag the information that was provided includes a traditional song that was never published to Dr. Darling knowledge of the Blue Bird series of traditional songs that was translated. This makes it accessible to the public and true to the song itself. Community members from the Four Southern Tribes who see the English translation will know what the song is talking about. Tempe Butte is different because it has quit a few songs different with it. Some songs are available in the academic literature but are not appropriate to share with the public. There was a great deal of camaraderie to find an appropriate song. Oidbad Do'ag means dead field mountain. Which probably refers the cultural systems and fields that once exist around the base of Tempe Butte. Which allows one to bring up the pre-history of the area. Tempe Butte is also been memorialized as a place where a historic battle occurred. In which serval enemies are

caught in the field with Cattle. They run up to the top of the mountain and they are surrounded on all sides. Where one escapes across the river to the North and lives to tell the tale. The images in the sign are the calendar sticks, and western Blue Bird. The bird is singing a petroglyph at the bottom. The last text in the sign explains that the petroglyphs are secret, and they need to be protected. That vandalize is a desecration. The sign will help in the understanding that the places are secret and need to be protected.

### **Commission Discussion**

Vice Chair Ball stated that he likes the sign and that he learned something new in the presentation. He appreciates the effort that the team went through to put together the graphics. In the graphic removing the modern roadways is very helpful to narrowing down the things that people can get to.

Commissioner Montero stated that the sign will be wonderful for Tempe.

Commissioner Larson asked is there any significant to the shade of Blue at the top of the sign.

Dr. Darling answered that it is because of the Blue bird and the song is a Blue bird song. One of the things down the road if it happens is that when more are in place when they do an internet format each sign is identified by a color scheme. Almost to the point of a tag where you click on it and see where all the signs are so people can go and see all the signs if they wish.

Commissioner Larson stated that he likes the map and how the roads are removed it caused him to look at the map and see the different peaks. He did find that in the legend there is a red dot that says Museum Heritage Center and in parentheses it says open to the public. Then the blue dots on the map makes one wonder if these places are open to the public. Which is not something that the public would know that they can visit. Maybe the open to the public could be removed.

Dr. Darling stated that it is a great comment and he will look at the caption and see if it can be more straightforward.

Mr. Southard stated that is a helpful suggestion and that they will be taking the piece to the Four Southern Tribes cultural resource working group meeting Friday February 19, 2021.

-----

#### 4) Presentation on Nanakmel Ki: / Bell Butte cultural resources survey and ethnographic report

##### Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the commissioners that they may recall a year ago give or take. There was work done on the water tank a top Bell Butte Mountain. Monitoring was recommended in which the City of Tempe hired Logan Simpson to complete the work. During that work there was disturbance at the North end of Bell Butte that was not permitted. In which Logan Simpson was brought on to complete damage assessment to make recommendations and complete mitigation work.

##### Presentation from: Craig Fertelmes & Andrew Darling

Mr. Fertelmes informed the commissioners that the study was a part of the culture resources damage assessment with the fiber line at the base of the Butte. At the base of the Butte there was no founding of previously undocumented subsurface cultural resources. However, in working the way through the evaluation process they found that they were not able to see the full assessment of damages to the Butte for two reasons. The first being that from an archaeological perspective there was an incomplete understanding of the culture resource on and around the Butte. There are a number of overlapping polygons, various site records, a lot of institutions having their own site records not being shared across the board. Despite all the archaeological tension that has been placed on the Butte there has never been a full comprehensive systematic survey of the Butte to date, so they were unaware

of what all was there. The second factor is that in the records it does show that there is a ceremonial cave site on the East face of the Butte. Was unsure why the place was so important. The culture resource needed to be informed not only through a more comprehensive archaeological survey but also a tribal perspective as well. This would be important because it would provide a better understanding of the culture sensitive areas of the Butte which would inform the damage assessment. Once it was determined how the place was significant in terms of the archaeological resources from the perspective of the tribe. It would help out the City with future planning and projects. A third goal was that in talking about the significant of the Butte with the tribe community there was a chance to help and preserve traditional memory cultures of the Butte. Which was great to keep the traditional stories of the Butte alive. The first being the archivable records review and digging into the records at the Museum it makes sense of all the different site records. The second was to conduct a comprehensive systemic survey of Bell Butte. The third aspect was the ethnographic study with the tribal members.

There are several sites that have been recorded or talked about. The best known is the ceremonial cave site. There are 13 other historic properties that have polygon and various institutional records in the area some over lapped and some had the same name in different locations. Through some detective archaeological work, the team was able to get them down to 9 properties which in the end was consolidated into one. They consist of the ceremonial cave site and four archaeological sites that were recorded on the slopes or atop the Butte. Which is both the prehistoric and historic artifacts. There are prehistoric canals that extend to the north and south end of the Butte. There are also historic canals and historic cemeteries on either side of the mountain. Was aware that there were some petroglyphs and bedrock mortars that have not been systematically documented to location extent and numbers.

The ceremonial cave site is the better-known cultural resource of the Butte. It was first vided in archaeological in the 1880's in the Hemenway expedition. Where he came and took all the items in the cave site and took them back East to curate and preserve. In 1945 Emil Hauray analyzed all the contains recovered by Cushing. As part of the synthesis of the Hemeway expedition, he concludes in is dissertation that all the items in the ceremonial cave site are not ancestor O'Odami but rather Puebloan in origin. In which he would argue that is a very incorrect conclusion. All objects of the tribal patrimony from the cave are held by the Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology at Harvard University in Cambridge, MA.

During the field work of the systematic survey of the Butte resulted in 14 discrete features and a number of artifacts scattered across the Butte. The 14 features where the cave site, petroglyphs, two areas of bedrock mortar clusters, hammerstones. There are 11 panels of the petroglyphs of which 32 were identified among the 11 panels. Most of the 27 elements of the 32 where found never he summit. Unfortunately, a number of them may have been destroyed by the construction of the water tank in the 1960's. There are a few panels at the lower slope including four never the cave. Most of the petroglyphs were the Gila style and common till about 1450 A.D. He showed the Commissioners a petroglyph that was not normally something of the Gila style.

Dr. Darling informed the Commissioners that the significant of Bats' Home or also named Bell Bette is acknowledged by the Four Southern Tribes as a cultural property. Particularly for the ceremonial cave that is there. The position of the cave extends to the Butte as a whole. When one talks about the cave it also refers to the Butte. Partly because of traditional and cultural significant features like the rock art and the bed rock mortars. Mortars are places that can receive offerings. There are also places like Bell Butte that have grinding areas and rock art that are known as sitting places or spiritual dwellings. One of the important things about Bats' Home is that the cave is the story about an evil sorcerer who becomes to the dark side of the medicine world in the West end of the Gila Indian Community. He is found out once a number of trouble things start to happen such as sickness and plaque. They identified the sorcerer and chased him into the cave at Bats' Home where he disguises himself as an albino bat. They were able to find, capture, and kill him at the place that he received his evil power. The Athem traditional name is Nanakmel kii means bats home. The Piipaash who were late to the area called it Qympanyk Nyiva which means place where bats live. Bats can be found in many places but when talking about Bats' Home it is the place where the evil sorcerer hid himself. There a song that has been recorded and was played as part of the blessing to the Butte. When you go into, the caves one can hear the sound of buzzing bees and feel the effects of almost feeling drunk. The further you go into the cave there is a sound of a reed flute playing and people singing. The cave has that effect because the person who is able to hear those sounds are accessible to the spiritual powers may enter the cave and they will pass out and receive those spiritual powers. The palace is meant to be respected. In regard to the special petroglyph

that was shown to the commissioners. Rock art was thought of to show the presence of a Gods house. The center part of the rock are does seem to show the maze or key of Gods home. Elders home which is South Mountain has a maze for its show of the Gods home. Whereas the Butte does not which means that the God that lived there would not need a maze to hid in.

The other aspects of the ethnographic study that has been on going for many of years now has been an attempt by the Salt River Community to secure the return of the collections particularly the deceased ancestors that were uncovered by the Hemanway expedition where a large amount of material was discovered. In 2013 Gila River and Salt River did go and visit the collections and walked by boxes and took a few photos of the excavation and verified that they were at the Museum. The team was able to reevaluate the earlier interpretation of Haury 1945 publication about the ethnic affiliation of the objects. It was in search of zoology from the track across the Colorado River. Which help connect the Salado migration and generally ignored the local connections. Nearly everything that was identified could be matched up with a Akimel analog some of which are still being used today. There were 1600 reed cigarettes or ceremonial smoking tubes that were recovered in 1888. Smoking tubes were made from six inches of carrizo into which smoking materials were inserted. Often placed in caves or ancient sites as a prayer offering. The story goes that if it does not kill you then you will come back with medicinal powers. One of the special things about the cane cigarettes is that there is often textiles wrapped around them. When looking at the 2013 photo record many have been separated from the cane cigarettes. What is interesting about the textiles is that they are miniature representation of dance sashes that would have been worn by dancers. One of the other common offerings were prayer stick offerings. Prayer sticks were used by Navajos and many cultures of the American Southwest. They are used for a common ceremony such as vegheeda. There are a number of prayer sticks offerings that came from the cave. The Effigy prayer sticks were southwest in character. There were also objects for curing in the cave. Mr. Darling shows pictures of the different curing objects to the Commissioners. There were also compound arrows for warfare that were called U'u arrows. It was said form one of the cultural experts that "this cave was an important part of ceremony very sacred. The sticks are used with the Navitchu. The small effigies are also his. This place is very old very powerful." Everything in the cave was there besides the mask but the mask was passed down to his son so it would not have been stored in the cave.

In conclusion the upfront goal of Tempe was to create a better understanding of the cultural resources with the Bell Butte and City planning. Ethnographic investigations reveal a direct, descendant affiliation of the Akimel O'odham and a long-standing historical connection of the Piipaash with Nanakmel Kii – Qmpanyk Nyiva( oral traditions, song culture, and material culture still in use today). Some things that they are working to get management recommendations is formal nomination of Nanakmel Kii – Qmpanyk Nyiva to the National Register of Historic Places. Formal recognition of the Akimel O' Odham name through the United States Board on Geographic Names. To the extent possibly facilitate the Salt River Pima Maricopa Indian Community in their efforts to repatriate the contents of the ceremonial cave pursuant to Federal and State Law and City of Tempe Ordinances. Regular trash collection and removal of graffiti including the "T". Removing the "T" is to help instore the integrity of the place. When one looks to the building of High Rise to protect the exposure of the Eastern face of Bell Butte to view the sunrise is another thing worth considering. When the sun does rise the cave fills with light. The final point is land ownership initiative.

Mr. Southard stated that a lot of the suggestions and recommendations that were made will require the consent of and participation of the landowner. There is a wide assumption that Tempe own Bell Butte however Tempe does not Maricopa county owns portions of the Butte. Tempe lease the space for a water tank and communication equipment. It seems the remainder of the Butte and the immediately surrounding property is likely owned by ADOT at one point the off ramp for the Broadway Road Exit ran East of Bell Butte. Last records show ADOT of owning it and whether they are aware of this or not is the question. The land ownership needs to be address if some of the recommendations should be implemented.

### **Commission Discussion**

Commissioner Montero stated that she really enjoyed reading the report.

-----

5) **Moeur Park Ramada Improvements Presentation**

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that Moeur Park is located North of the river, East of Mill Avenue, and both North and South of Curry Road. The portions of the Park being discussed is the portion south of Curry Road. There are WPA in both the North and South portions of the Park. The WPA structures are listed in the Historic Register. The WPA structures were also listed for the National structure listing. It was assumed up until recently that the WPA structures and the WPA structures alone were the contributing elements alone as it relates the National registered nomination. It seems that the Steel rail ramada on top of the South portion of the Park. One of the ramadas at the lower elevation of the South portion of the park in addition to the concert staircase and some other items are listed as contributing features of the National Register Nomination. This requires review and approval by the HPC that is not what is being asked tonight they are early in the process they do wish to seek input and share where they are with the group.

Presentation from Craig Hayton & Erin Krikpatrick

Mr. Hayton informed the commissioners that Moeur Park also seats partially on Papago reserve aera too. This gives them the chance to engage with the Desert Conservation Committee.

Ms. Kirkpatrick stated that they are seeking the advice and input on some of the conceptual renderings that they have come up with. Moeur Park sits just over Mill Avenue bridge at Mill and Curry. The Park is bisected by Curry Road and the part they are focusing on is the Southern section. Which is half in the preserve and half out. The park has both historical models on the lawn area and outside of the preserve as well as the hilltop. When first working on the site there were stone ramadas, raised planter beds, raised benches and tables in the park. Those were built from 1936 to 1938. Funding is from the SRPMIC Grant & Parks CIP to do the work on the park. The goal is to restore the lower ramadas. Potentially restore or replace the upper ramadas. Other improvements include additional accessibility. Whenever they can they try to come into compliance and create ADA access. Adding side lighting, walkway lighting, and new site furnishings. Showed the commissioners pictures of the WPA ramadas. There are plans from Aztec and how to go about the restoration work. There is corrosion on the roofs that need to be repaired, replacing the grout and masonry replacement from materials on site hopefully, repairing damage stone, and reconfiguring the electric. Aztec had some questions on if the ramadas on the hilltop where sound enough to stay. They are very low hanging and the roofs are fabricated with railroad ties and steel which is not in the best condition. The initial approach is to use elements that would call to those materials but would be modernized and accessible. There are two options that showed the commissioners and in option A which could be problematic because it moves the current staircase to the South to create a seamless entry from the parking lot. Where option B lives the staircase and moves the sidewalk. Adding an ADA accessible ramp to the park that will travel all the way down to Mill Avenue. There were roof renderings that she showed the Commissioners. There is a virtual public meeting Tuesday February 16, 2021 at noon and then a survey that will be open to the public from February 16, 2021 to February 28, 2021. The design process will be through the summer of 2021 and construction in the early part of 2022.

**Commission Discussion**

Vice Chair ball asked if the railroad ties are listed as part of the material that is part of the register list.

Mr. Southard answered that there are four rails up top and one in the lower elevations. They were constructed in the 1950's. They were attributed to a gentleman by the name of Mr. Vanhorn. There accounted as an innovative design since the steel rails would be very difficult to damage. Unlikely to be compromised in the near future. The roofing material at the time was palm fat should it be blown away or damaged could be easily replaced. They date to the 1950's and they are contributing features.

Ms. Kirkpatrick stated that they were aware of this information about a week ago.

Vice Chair Ball stated that the accessible pathway to the park and lower area moving itself from behind the WPA structure. The proposed modification to the original WPA stair is going to be seriously problematic. The removal of the

staircase and the ramadas up top should only be considered if they are deemed to be nonrepairable. If additional ramadas are conditioned on the site, the least impact from the traditional point of use of the lower area of the site where the original materials were placed is a guiding viewpoint.

Mr. Southard stated that the stairs in fact are contributing they date to the 1950's.

Chair Buss asked if the plan was to replace the railroad ties with railroad ties again.

Ms. Kirkpatrick stated they asked that steel and the railroad ties themselves would be used. Or something similar. There are steel ties that are there at the moment.

Commissioner Garrison stated that he agrees with Vice Chair Ball approach that the ramadas should be looked at as restoration if they need to change a little bit. Leave one in tack to represent the others. The treatment should be rehabilitation.

Commissioner Garraty said that he is not sure what level of ground disturbance there is going to be with the excavations. Has there been discussion on archaeological monitoring?

Ms. Kirkpatrick answered that there has been being that is very close to the river they have anticipated that the whole project will need to be monitored.

Commissioner Garrison asked if the nomination should not focus on the indivial features but work toward a district nomination. That way some of the treat options would not be so restricted.

Mr. Southard stated that he is not sure what the HRC or HSRC would be listed under a local level. It is worth looking at. The real challenge would be to processing the request. Not aware of the timeline constraints. But it is a good idea that is worth considering but there is a potential that it would not pan out.

-----

6) Historic Preservation Plan priorities

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

This is a follow up opportunity to if anyone has any thoughts or comments to last month's presentation.

**Commission Discussion**

Vice Chair Ball stated that he does not have anything to add at this time.

-----

7) Chair / Staff Updates

The panels that Jacob butler designed are not complete and working on installation in the near future.

2021 Historic Preservation Conference has been moved and will be in October.

The Subcommittee for the First Congregational Church meet February 10, 2021 and instructed staff to reach to the developer for creative mitigation.

8) Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items

- Member Announcements
- **Staff Announcements**



Hearing adjourned at 8:14 pm

-----  
Prepared by: Brittainy Nelson, Administrative Assistant  
Reviewed by:

Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner

---

SA:bn