



## Minutes City of Tempe Sustainability Commission May 17, 2021

Minutes of the Tempe Sustainability Commission meeting held on Monday, May 17, 2021, 4:30 p.m. at a virtual meeting on MS Teams, through City Hall, 31 E. 5<sup>th</sup> Street, Tempe, Arizona.

**(MEMBERS) Present:**

Kendon Jung (Chair)  
Barbie Burke  
Steven Russell  
Stephanie Milam-Edwards

Katja Brundiers  
Gretchen Reinhardt  
Anna Melis

**(MEMBERS) Absent:**

Ryan Mores (Vice Chair)  
Sukki Jahnke  
John Kane

**City Staff Present:**

Braden Kay  
Grace DelMonte Kelly  
Haven Bills  
Shauna Warner  
Robert Yabes

**Guests Present:**

David Sokolowski  
Joe Forte  
Linda Stenholm  
Shawn Swisher

Chair Jung called the meeting to order at 4:33 p.m.

**Agenda Item 1 – Public Appearances**

Chair Jung asks any guests to introduce themselves.

No public appearances were made.

**Agenda Item 2 – Approval of Meeting Minutes**

Chair Jung introduced the minutes of the April 19th, 2021 meeting. Commissioner Russell made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Burke seconded.

**Motion:** Commissioner Russell

**Second:** Commissioner Burke

**Decision:** Approved 7-0

Voted to Approve:

Kendon Jung (Chair)

Barbie Burke

Gretchen Reinhardt

Katja Brundiers

Anna Melis

Steve Russell

Stephanie Milam-Edwards

Motion Passed 7-0.

### **Agenda Item 3 – TDM & TDA Plan & Mobility Hubs Plan**

Principal Planner in charge of Transportation Planning, Robert Yabes, presented the TDM & TDA Plan and Mobility Hubs Plan

- The projects are strongly coordinated with the Council Priorities – the 20-minute city, travel time, and the community carbon reduction goal.
- There are three important planning projects:
  - Transportation Demand Management is a plan for how the city will manage and operate transportation.
    - Enhancing system efficiency and promoting multimodal development
    - Allowing us to use our bike lanes/busses efficiently.
  - The Transportation Management Association plan is about creating a forum for private/public partnerships and moving away from single occupancy commutes.
    - An important collaboration tool that allows for implementation of TDM
  - Mobility Hubs are about creating alternatives for single occupancy car trips.
    - Locating infrastructure – such as scooter or bike share – so that they are accessible for people who want to use them.
    - Clustering infrastructure to support TMA and TDM.
- These projects will accomplish the sustainability goals and growth demands.
- They will establish partnerships for private/public collaboration for transportation/mobility.
- Mobility Hubs are about providing infrastructure for a variety of transportation choices.

Question: How are mobility hubs different from making busses and light rail stations pedestrian friendly?

Answer: You can look at the transit center as a mobility hub, it also brings together bikes, buses, light rail. There are 5 different types of mobility hubs. Mr. Yabes described the different types of Mobility Hubs later in the presentation.

- TDM Defined
  - The goal is applying strategies that improve efficiency and effectiveness of transportation.
  - Results - TDM can help with travel demand and creating/incentivizing healthier choices.
  - Provided examples and images of TDM on the screen:
    - Bicycle parking and support facilities
    - Shared micro-mobility parking.

- Car share parking (often with electric charging).
  - Convenient passenger pick-up and drop-off
    - Few locations exist in Tempe currently.
  - Travel and trip planning information.
  - Comfortable waiting areas
    - Chair Jung mentioned that this connects to Councilperson Kuby's interest in bus stations and coverage/shelters at bus stops.
  - Wayfinding to surrounding locations.
  - Kiosts/retail, mobile services, and delivery lockers
- Incentive examples include:
  - Transit passes;
  - Rideshare programs;
  - Parking cash out;
  - Guaranteed ride home.
- Policy examples include:
  - Land use patterns;
  - Strategy compliance;
  - Enforcement;
  - Telework/compressed work week/flex schedule.
- TDM is not just facilities but also additional programs that can be implemented by independent employers. These programs could be recommended by the City.
- TDM Impact
  - Can provide so much relief to our transportation systems.
  - Slide shows some examples of impacts from TDM in different cities.
- What is TDM about
  - Shifting priority away from driving alone, collaborating with employers/residents, and creating travel options.

Question: Are bike facilities included in TDM?

Answer: Yes, they are some of the most implemented options regarding TDM.

Comment: Commissioner Reinhardt mentions that it is important to include improvements to the bicycle grid, not just facilities.

Response: Mr. Yabes mentions that this is included in the plan and that this is what they are aiming for.

- TMA Defined
  - Provides institutional frameworks and establishes a public/private partnership.
  - There is an opportunity to custom design a TMA that best meets community needs.
  - Allows resources to be pooled across organizations.
- TMA examples
  - Mr. Yabes presented a Community Oriented example from Boston.
  - Member Led – the TMA is not another government entity; it is a member-led initiative and can include the government to provide support as needed.
- TMA's are results focused and they advocate for convening leaders
  - There is a lot of work to do in this area and stakeholder engagement will help to inform the TMA strategy.
    - There have been groups in Tempe that have been invited to share what the TMA should look like.
- Mobility Hubs
  - Places to combine different modes of transportation in one physical location.

- Designed to reduce the need for single bicycle ownership and single occupancy driving trips.
    - Images on the screen show bike share and the transit center in Tempe.
- Mobility Hub example:
  - Image on slide shows how these hubs can be spread across neighborhoods. They are not compact, but they are still within walking distance from each other to align with the 20-minute city goal.
- Five mobility contexts to be envisioned:
  - Gateways to major destinations
  - Neighborhood park locations
    - Mr. Yabes mentioned that the team is asking to set aside potential park location to be designated as mobility hubs.
    - Parks are great locations because they are close to connectors.
    - They serve the community well because they can offer different mobility options to go from residential areas to parks and then to other major transit stations using the different mobility options.
  - Park and ride
    - Plans to leverage existing network.
    - The question is whether these can be more than just about parking your car and getting into a carpool.
      - What if it can be for autonomous vehicles
    - Mr. Yabes mentions that there have been proposals for this and there will be designs in the future.
  - Curbside locations
    - This is the most difficult because of the current lack of right-of-way.
    - As part of the design process, Mr. Yabes mentions the plan to envision these and provide solutions.
  - Private developments
    - One of Tempe's greatest opportunities is how fast the city is growing.
      - Culs-de-sac is one of these options.
    - Other office developments are trying to figure out alternatives to transportation in order to keep tenants longer.
- Next steps
  - There are two upcoming public meetings:
    - May 22<sup>nd</sup> at 9:30am
    - May 26<sup>th</sup> at 12:00pm
      - For more information visit: [www.tempe.gov/TDM](http://www.tempe.gov/TDM) or [www.tempe.gov/mobilityhubs](http://www.tempe.gov/mobilityhubs)
  - A survey regarding this information is available at the above website as well and is open until May 31<sup>st</sup>, 2021.
- If you have any questions, please reach out to Robert Yabes or talk to Shauna Warner or Braden Kay.

#### Commissioner Questions and Comments:

- In addition to making it more attractive to use multiple modes of transportation, is there a plan to make it less attractive to use single occupancy trips? If we build something new, do we need to weaken the existing experience of using your own car?
  - One of the key issues is traffic. If there is traffic and there are no additional options, there are significant improvements on the ridership to use alternatives.
  - Before the pandemic, there were companies that were offering parking incentives.
  - We know there is demand. It is a matter of time.
- How does the TMA play with neighborhood needs? Commissioner was concerned with a stronger focus towards a single occupancy vehicle and those kinds of uses of the rode (EV), but was not seeing mention of

the plans that are there and where they get funded. How does this new association do anything but weigh heavier on road infrastructure, rather than alternative structure?

- Transit tax is being collected and transit is the biggest investment for alternative travel.
- There are also investments in bike facilities and efforts to implement them.
- There are also efforts to add safer bicycle facilities as part of the deal for providing incentives for alternative trips.
- Would TMA only apply to Mill Avenue and areas with severe congestion.
  - Yes
  - The idea of the TMA is community governance for the congested area.
  - Tempe would continue to invest in bike infrastructure and Mobility Hubs without necessarily TMA guidance.
  - Would also include ASU research area – those are big enough where they could have their own TMA.
- A Commissioner raised concern for equity and that those who do not already have the grid built out will be left out.
  - They are also looking into this. Priority will be given to areas where it's needed most.
- Are we envisioning basically a network of TMAs across the city addressing the issues of high transit activity?
  - Not just high transit but any high residential area where we could present alternatives.
  - If there is a neighborhood association, maybe there could be a TMA developed there so that you don't invest so much of your money in transit
- Is the action the City is taking regarding these issues creating the action to allow TMAs and then facilitating them?
  - Yes and making sure the Sustainability Commission continues to support them
- Chair Jung pointed out that, in reference to Commissioner Reinhardt's point when the City had the McClintock bike lane debacle, very few members came forward. There is an additional definition of equity that is applied in this space and that is just folks who are driving into these areas and are complaining about things that don't impact their immediate surroundings and just impact their ability to get from Point A to Point B. This connects to how we support all forms of transit and not just single occupancy.
  - People who drive from South Tempe and come to downtown do not have the same perspective as those interested in a public process for bikers – Bikers are being drowned out by people who don't live there.

Additional Commissioner questions requiring follow-up:

- How are the elements of the TDM and the TMA and all of the 20-min city strategies going to be incorporated into non-city mandatory requirements for massive multi-million-dollar infrastructure developments as well as voluntarily leased for folks not looking for entitlements and looking for incentives?
- How are we connecting to areas that have lower socioeconomic status that may not have the same resources?
- Is the City discussing incentives for businesses and housing developments to add alternate modes of transportation and/or mobility hubs?
- Is there ever a possibility of completely free bus/light rail passes in Tempe? I understand the valley metro has a lot of power over that but could it be changed?
  - free bus/light rail passes would help not only students but families and would provide incentives for people to use mass transit.
- Can all our kids get to their schools by bike? That has huge health consequences for long-term.
  - At this time, no. Not all our kids can get to their schools by bike.
  - Unfortunately, the schools are not advocating for all students being able to walk/bike to school (for legal reasons).
- Can we build equity into the structure of TMAs? Could build in structural components to encourage equity.

---

**Agenda Item 4 – Keep Tempe Beautiful**

Joe Forte presented an update on Keep Tempe Beautiful.

- Keep Tempe Beautiful is a chapter of Keep America Beautiful and was started at the end of last year.
- They received their 501c3 approval at the end of last week.
- Each chapter is their own 501c3 and have different focuses depending on the needs of the community.
- Keep Tempe Beautiful has 3 main initiatives:
  - Litter
  - Recycling
  - Beautification of the city
- Commissioners can get involved by:
  - Keep Tempe Beautiful does park clean-ups the third Saturday of every month.
  - Everyone can go to [www.keeptempebeautiful.org](http://www.keeptempebeautiful.org) and sign up for the newsletter to be aware of any events
- Goals for speaking to the Commission today:
  - How can Keep Tempe Beautiful get involved in the Climate Action Plan and support whatever initiative that is focused on?
    - Chair Jung mentions the highlight action plans from the Climate Action Plan and how they may align with Keep Tempe Beautiful. Provided an update on the fact that we are currently underway with the Climate Action Plan
    - Dr. Kay mentioned that he can connect with Mr. Forte on the climate action plan and have Keep Tempe Beautiful invited
  - How can Keep Tempe Beautiful partner with any organizations the commission is a part of that may have overlapping initiatives
  - How can Keep Tempe Beautiful initiate a group clean-up with the Commission?
    - If there is a volunteer link, Chair Jung would be happy to share

Commissioner Questions:

- What else are you looking for in terms of involvement from this commission?
  - The main thing that Keep Tempe Beautiful has done so far is park cleanups (because of waiting for 501c3).
  - One thing would be if anyone is a neighborhood chair or knows the person who heads up their neighborhood, Keep Tempe Beautiful would be interested in connecting with the neighborhood chairs and allow the clean-ups to be sustainable.
  - Mr. Forte states that he was primarily on the call to make members more aware of what Keep Tempe Beautiful is doing and that the initiative is progressing.
  - Some of the main initiatives are getting into recycling education. Keep Tempe Beautiful would love to get involved with schools, community gardens and possibly expanding that program.
  - Chair Jung stated that in regards to getting involved with neighborhood chairs, Shauna Warner can be contacted regarding the Neighborhood Advisory Commission.
    - Recycling education exists online if it's not already attached to the bins.

**Agenda Item 5 – Green Infrastructure**

Sustainability Director Braden Kay presented an update on Green Infrastructure in Tempe and shared a video overview of the work that has been happening in Tucson. Dr. Kay mentioned that it is important to follow in Tucson's footsteps. The video is about Green Stormwater Infrastructure and how they managed their initiative.

Video notes:

- Green Stormwater Infrastructure is a stormwater management technique.

- Low Impact Development (LID) is the stormwater management technique.
- Green Stormwater Infrastructure (GSI) is the techniques used to realize LID.
- City of Tucson has institutionalized adapting and approving elements that are now regulatory processes.
  - Commercial rainwater harvesting ordinance has been in place since 2010.
  - Green stormwater fund and proposal in 2019
    - Will generate about \$3 million/year to apply to GSI features.
- Timeline:
  - Over the last 10 years, the Mayor and Council has approved and adopted projects.
  - 2010 – conservation fee approved
  - 2015 - Pima County resolution about climate protection and approving the Pima County General Plan
  - City staff has also been taking action to make change:
    - 2006 – Curb cuts approved
    - 2013 – administrative directive that all new and redesigned streets needed to look at Green Infrastructure
    - In 2015/16, a low-income wastewater rebate program after inequities were found.
  - Even earlier, there were community members and University of Arizona affiliates that were suggesting that the City should implement these things and move them forward.
  - Staff itself has been working jurisdictionally towards getting the Mayor and Council towards the point where they feel comfortable adapting and promoting these types of practices.
    - The 2008 Tucson-Pima Country Water/Wastewater Study was incredibly important.
      - One action from this plan was to create the WSP Action Plan: LID/GI Guidance Manual and Case Studies
- Partners and Collaborators were essential to get to the point where they are today.
  - The image on the video shows a number of partners including the City of Tucson, Pima County, Pima Association of Government, Universities, NGOs and others.
- Tucson does this because of the community
  - As public entities they are all about public safety and welfare
  - Goal to increase urban forest canopy and reduce nuisance flooding in low-income neighborhoods
- Some programs were Neighborhood Scale Stormwater Harvesting
- 2018 – passed a Parks and Connections bond that will provide quite a bit of money for the city to improve the parks
  - \$255 million over 10 years

Dr. Kay mentions that this is what happens when a city becomes invested in the work – they get the funding and the investment and it is important to build an argument towards this. Dr. Kay states that Tempe needs a Green Infrastructure Road Map for the City. Building this road map is one of the first things we'll do for the next budget. Dr. Kay mentions that it is important to develop political will and organize investments and get people excited about the water department, urban forester, parks etc.

#### Commissioner Questions:

- How can we get the map they had in Tucson and if there's any newer ones in Tempe and Phoenix?
  - Dr. Kay answered that we have been working on a new heat vulnerability map and we should be able to share that in the next couple maps
- In the last budget the Tree Canopy got a lot of support from the council, is there a way that this could also be pushed towards the council a little more?
  - Yes, they are interested in funding streets and right-of-way and trees so it is not a far cry to ask to also focus on Green Infrastructure. There are 5 budgets that we could be using to push Green Infrastructure more that we're not fully utilizing. When you write your next Green Infrastructure recommendation to council, include prioritization of Green Infrastructure.

**Agenda Item 6 – Climate Action Plan Update**

Sustainability Director Braden Kay presented an update on the Climate Action Plan 2021 Update

City of Tempe Office of Sustainability Climate Justice Fellow Haven Bills presented the draft run-of-show for the Youth Listening Session to be held on June 22nd from 4:00pm – 5:30pm.

**Agenda Item 7 – Sustainability and Livability Council Committee**

Chair Jung presented the Sustainability and Livability Council Committee and stated that he is looking for help in the sign-up process with Commissioners. Will plan to connect in the next two weeks.

Dr. Kay will bring next 3-4 months of agenda items and will continue to have this on the calendar so that the Commission can be informed.

**Agenda Item 8 – Housekeeping**

Chair Jung presented housekeeping items.

Chair Jung introduces the first housekeeping item, Commission positions – there is one vacant Graduate Position. It seems to be a difficult position to keep filled. Chair Jung makes recommendation to change the Graduate Position to a “Phoenix Metro At Large” position.

Commissioner Questions:

- Why would we do Phoenix metro vs Tempe?
  - It is a strategic move to have a maximum of one position that can be outside of Tempe. There are issues that we miss out on when we focus on Tempe only. It would only be one position and would not be extended beyond that.
- 18 and older?
  - There is no age limit currently but we would have to decide if there was an age limit for this new position.
- Was there a reason for the grad position?
  - To bring diverse perspectives and thought
- Commissioner points out that there has not been much racial diversity on the Commission.
  - Yes, this is absolutely a concern and this position could open the options.

Chair Jung asked if there is a motion to amend the position from a Graduate Position to a Phoenix Metro At Large position. Commissioners ask that the issue be brought up again at the next meeting for an official vote. This suggestion is to loosen this particularly challenging to keep filled role.

The item will be an action item at the next commission meeting.

Chair Jung brings up the second item of changing the Office of Sustainability's name.

- Some cities have changed their names, some cities have an Office of Sustainability and an Office of Resilience such as New York and LA
- Phoenix has an Office of Heat
- Sustainability and Resilience need to be coupled together.
  - There have been examples where extreme heat has been used as an excuse to use more fossil fuels and it is important to make sure that doesn't happen.



- There could be a movement to separate Sustainability from Resilience otherwise.
- Do we want to change the name to the Office of Sustainability and Resilience or to the Office of Sustainability and Resilience to Extreme Heat?

This has to go through several processes including rewriting the ordinance that created the council in 2018

We do not have to decide today and could decide next meeting.

The item will be an action item at the next Commission meeting.

#### Commissioner Questions and Comments:

- Councilmember Reinhardt asks for the ability to see insights or statements regarding the two names.
- Over the next weeks, please send any thoughts on the name change to Grace DelMonte Kelly and Braden Kay. If received 10 days before the next meeting these comments will be included in the meeting agenda for discussion at the 6/21/2021 meeting.
- Councilmember Brundiers mentions that there is research into the way these fields are set up and there are recommendations that these offices are not siloed but integrated and collaborative. These issues are very connected, and we need a focus on collective impact.
- In the chat, Councilmember Milam-Edwards asks about cost of changing letterheads.
  - Dr. Kay answers that there will be very little cost due to lack of logo material in place currently.

Chair Jung introduces the third housekeeping item, Race to Zero.

- An initiative for cities to pledge to reach net zero greenhouse gas emissions as soon as possible, at longest mid-century.
- Tempe has carbon neutrality goals, but this would help Tempe move up the goals and would make these happen faster.
- The adoption of this commitment pledge could be used to move forward mitigation factors faster and have a proactive response to what may be coming out of the federal administration in next few years.
- Chair Jung moves the motion to approve to next meeting.

#### Commissioner Questions and Comments:

- The action on part of the Commission would be recommending to Council that we complete the Race to Zero pledge and potentially also join the Race to Resilience which is a sister program that hasn't fully formed yet but is very exciting.
- Does this help move us forward and is it doable?
  - Councilmember Kay responds that it isn't doable at the level of expenditure and movement we have now but if we're going to be competitive for grants and consider ourselves a serious city around this work then we should join.
  - Phoenix has joined and Tucson and Flagstaff will join soon if they have not already.
  - If we do not join it shows that we aren't taking climate quite as seriously as those cities.
- Commissioner asks if the Council would be more willing to sign on if we waited to a later date?
  - The timing that we bring it up to Council is still up to question. We will be bringing it up to Council on the 26<sup>th</sup>. We will need a presentations from experts and waiting until June is okay within the timeline that we have.
  - There will be a deeper presentation on the 26<sup>th</sup>

Chair Jung brings to the second to last item regarding the letters to Council for the EnVision Hub and the IGCC.

- Chari Jung asks for approval on what is written or to continue this item.
- Motion is to submit to Council after edits of the placeholder that Steven pointed out (the instance of [date] in the text), and the two items to make this a requirement for mandatory and voluntary incentives.

**Motion:** Commissioner Milam-Edwards

**Second:** Commissioner Reinhardt

**Decision:** Approved 7-0

Voted to Approve:

Kendon Jung (Chair)  
Barbie Burke  
Katja Brundiers  
Anna Melis  
Steve Russell  
Stephanie Milam-Edwards  
Gretchen Reinhardt

Approved 7-0

Staff will forward the two letter to City Council.

Dr. Kay introduces the last item that the City of Tempe Office of Sustainability is now recruiting for a Youth Council.

- Dr. Kay shared a video regarding the Cool Kids program after the agenda was closed

**Agenda Item 9 – Future Agenda Items**

Commissioner Russell made a motion to adjourn.

**Motion:** Commissioner Russell

**Second:** Commissioner Melis

**Decision:** Approved 7-0

Voted to Approve:

Kendon Jung (Chair)  
Barbie Burke  
Gretchen Reinhardt  
Katja Brundiers  
Anna Melis  
Steve Russell  
Stephanie Milam-Edwards

Motion Passed 7-0.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:39 pm.

Prepared by: Haven Bills

Reviewed by: Grace DeMonte Kelly